



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Civil Service Commission Agenda Via Zoom Webinar Friday, January 22, 2021, 3:00 PM

For the safety of staff and residents, in-person attendance is not permitted. Join the Zoom webinar as a viewer or listener from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device. Join online at <https://zoom.us/j/95200062218?pwd=a1VEQ2Z5UU9QUWNzSHdPaTIMWIJXUT09>
Password: 33553400; Description: Civil Service Commission; or join by phone at 833-548-0282 (toll free); Webinar ID: 952 0006 2218, International numbers available at <https://zoom.us/u/at2uk02hE>

1. Approval of January 7, 2021 meeting minutes.

Documents:

[MINUTES010721.DOCX](#)

2. Overview & Discussion of Fire Entry-Level Process.

Documents:

[EXHIBIT A - EXPIRED ELIGIBILITY LIST.PDF](#)
[EXHIBIT B - COMPARISON.PDF](#)

3. Recommendation for testing company for Fire Entry-Level Process.

Documents:

[CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEMO 1-22-21.DOCX](#)

4. Schedule next meeting date and time.

To request an accommodation for a person with a disability, call the City's ADA Coordinator at 216-491-1440, or Ohio Relay Service at 711 for TTY users.



**Civil Service Commission Minutes
Thursday, January 7, 2021 at 3:00 P.M.
Via Teleconference - Zoom**

DRAFT

Members Present: Sandra I. Kiely, Chairperson
Ronald Fountain, Commissioner
Lee Trotter, Commissioner
Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary

Others Present: William Ondrey Gruber, Director of Law
Jeffrey DeMuth, Police Chief
Patrick Sweeney, Fire Chief
James Heath, Assistant Fire Chief
Sandra Middleton, Director of Human Resources

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Sandra Kiely at 3:02 p.m.

* * * *

Approval of the November 23, 2020 Meeting Minutes

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve November 23, 2020, meeting minutes moved by Commissioner Kiely and second by Commissioner Fountain and minutes were approved.

* * * *

Civil Service Commission Memo

Commissioner Kiely turned the decision over to Sandra Middleton, Human Resources Director regarding implementation of civil service commission memo that would outline in detail the discussion for the meeting.

* * * *

Recommendation to cancel current Police Entry-Level Eligibility List - Exhibit A and Exhibit B.

Ms. Middleton shared **Exhibit A** - Eligibility List that we currently have a police entry-level eligibility list that was established on September 23, 2019 and according to the Civil Service Rules it stays in place for up to two years unless the Commission takes action otherwise. Ms. Middleton explained that we have gone through this list, we have hired six (6) off the list and have vetted everyone else that remain and do not think we will get another viable candidate off this list. Ms. Middleton recommend that the Commission cancel this list so we can establish a new list. Commission Kiely stated that the Commission is being requested to cancel the list. Are there any comment or questions regarding this before we take a vote? Commission Lee Trotter asked how many people

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS

3400 Lee Road Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120 P 216.491.1400 F 216.491.1465 Ohio Relay Service 711
shakeronline.com www.shaker.life

were left. Chief Police Jeffery DeMuth replied there where two people left on the list that remained as viable candidates. Commissioner Kiely stated the current list is not going to yield any additional hirers, we have a request to cancel the list. Do I have a motion? So, moved by Commissioner Fountain and second by Commissioner Trotter. Commissioner Kiely stated the list has been cancelled.

Ms. Middleton explained **Exhibit B - Test Cycle Outcomes** gives test outcome of how many people have applied, how many people passed and the ranking of the lowest candidate hired. Ms. Middleton mentioned that some years ago we changed the Civil Service Rules to include the top 20 and that allows us to go further down the eligibility list. **Exhibit B** goes back to 2007 to the most recent test in 2019, showing how many we have hired off each list. Off the list just cancelled we hired six and that is in line with what we have done for the last few test cycles. The bottom half of **Exhibit B** gives the demographics of who we hired and how many remain. The Commission had a lengthy discussion about changing the hiring process and ways to retain existing employees. Commissioner Kiely motioned to change the requirement to applicants in the SHPD must be either currently enrolled in a Police School or working in a Police Department. So moved by Commissioner Fountain and second by Commissioner Trotter. Commission Kiely noted for the record all in favor.

* * * *

Overview & Discussion of recommended Police Lateral Process - Exhibit C and Exhibit 4.

Ms. Middleton shared **Exhibit C - 2019 Adverse Impact by Test Cycle Outcomes**. Ms. Middleton explained the challenges in this pandemic and not being ready for a large gatherings, require us to change our test. We have used the Structured Interview test in the past with great success. Commissioner Kiely asked are we losing a step. Ms. Middleton replied we are not I'm just saying why we are not going back to the structured interview process. Ms. Middleton explained that the structured interview was the test. Ms. Middleton discussed **Exhibit 4 - 2021 Police Exam Cost Comparison**. Ms. Middleton presented two companies for comparison, IPMA is (Structured Interview) is not listed because we cannot have that type of testing during the pandemic. Ms. Middleton stated the City is recommending the B-Pad Group, Inc., that was used in 2014 for a lateral entrance. B-Pad is video based and can be taken at home with a webcam. We will make every effort to eliminate any barriers for someone to participate in the process by lending webcams if necessary. The process is scenario base on eight scenarios that are chosen and the applicant acts as if they are the Police Officer on the scene.

* * * *

Recommendation and approval of testing company.

Commissioner Kiely asked you are making this recommendation that we approve the B-Pad Group for the testing, based on purchasing 50 exams. Ms. Middleton stated we don't have to limit it to 50 exams. This is just for the purposes of showing competitiveness. Commissioner Kiely asked is there a motion? So moved by Commissioner Trotter and second by Commissioner Fountain. The motion has been approved to hire the B-Pad Group.

* * * *

Designate Chair for 2021.

Ms. Middleton asked the Commissioners to designate a Chair for 2021. Commissioner Fountain so moved to nominate Commissioner Sandra Kiely to be the Chair of the Civil Service Commission for the next year and Commissioner Trotter second. Commissioner Kiely was approved for Chair for 2021.

*

*

*

*

Calendars were checked and a future Civil Service Commission meeting was scheduled for Friday, January 22, 2021 at 3:30 p.m.

There being no further business, Commissioner Kiely adjourned the meeting at 4:12 p.m.

Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary
Civil Service Commission

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2017 FIREFIGHTER/PARAMEDIC ENTRY LEVEL
ELIGIBILITY LIST CERTIFIED - OCTOBER 18, 2017

Ranking	New Ranking	Last Name	First Name	Final Score	
1	1	Oberacker	Peter	96	
2	*2	Kus	Nicholas	95	
3	3	Caldwell	Jeremy	93	
4	4	Creamer	Jason	92	
5		Sterle	Frank	92	Started 7/16/18
6		DeVor	Christopher	92	Pending removal
7	5	Hollinshead	Joseph	91	
8		Hageman	Michael	91	Started 2/4/19
9		Nych	Brian	91	withdrew 8/9/19
10		Elenniss	Joshua	91	Started 2/4/19
11	6	Bures	Robert	90	
12	7	Bamber	Sean	90	
13		Miller	John	89	Started 7/15/19
14		Cooper	Brandon	89	declined
15		Wiklinski	Joseph	89	withdrew 4/25/18
16		Crouse	Dillon	89	Started 7/16/18
17	8	Nees	David	89	
18		Freeman	Benjamin	89	withdrew 2/21/18
19	9	Fletcher	Brennen	88	
20		Wheeler	Christopher	88	withdrew 4/25/18
21		Bruce	Zachary	88	withdrew 8/14/19
22		Farshchian	Luke	88	withdrew 8/8/19
23		Angeloff	Clayton	88	withdrew 8/8/19
24		Armstrong	Robert	88	withdrew 8/9/19
25		Maslocha	Joshua	86	withdrew 8/8/19
26		Foster	Jake	86	withdrew 8/8/19
27	10	Steiner III	William	86	
28	11	Groh	Connor	86	Started 2/3/20
29	12	Ozog, Jr.	Michael	85	
30		Huhn III	Gary	85	
31		Martin	Zachary	85	withdrew 8/12/19
32	13	Fultz	Christopher	85	
33		Jalovec	Dalton	85	withdrew 8/13/19
34	14	Piper, Jr.	Leroy	85	Cond. Offer 9/24/19
35	15	Fawcett	Eric	85	
36	16	Sedlay	Alexander	84	
37		Corsillo	Daniel	84	withdrew 8/13/19
38	17	Brettrager II	Royal	84	
39	18	Kalgreen	Kayla	84	
40	19	Damas	Scott	84	
41	20	Zlotkowski	Sebastian	84	Cond. Offer 9/24/19
42		Wright	Alonzo	84	

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
 2017 FIREFIGHTER/PARAMEDIC ENTRY LEVEL
 ELIGIBILITY LIST CERTIFIED - OCTOBER 18, 2017

Ranking	New Ranking	Last Name	First Name	Final Score
43		Zmija	Eric	84
44		Gaffney	James	84
45		Fisher	Lauren	83
46		Romischer	Joseph	83
47		Wise	Justin	83
48		Makaryk	Christopher	83
49		Rienzi	Joseph	83
50		Kehn	Jack	82
51		Sopko	Jesse	82
52		Kremer	Benjamin	82
53		Nixon	Edward	82
54		Davidson	Keith	82
55		Bender	Clifford	81
56		Bynane	Kyle	81
57		Roy	Jeremy	81
58		Comley	Michael	81
59		Ritley	Charles	81
60		Fortune	John	81
61		Sroka	Marcin	80
62		Erdani	Samuel	80
63		Girardi	Anthony	80
64		Wick	Andrew	80
65		Nickels	Michael	80
66		Kovacs	Brian	80
67		Bixler	Jonathan	80
68		Reeves	Frederick	80
69		Quinn	Colin	79
70		Wright	Seiji	79
71		Huffman	Bryon	79
72		Lambros	Mackenzie	79
73		Milne	Christopher	79
74		Holmes	Robert	79
75		Rolf	Ryan	78
76		Giffels	Evan	78
77		Henderson	Callahan	78
78		Watrall	David	78
79		Meek	Leonard	78
80		Whitczak	Kyle	77
81		Pekar	Alexander	77
82		Stech	Daniel	77
83		Finkler	Cory	77
84		Madden	Aaron	76
85		Hayden	Corey	76
86		Paul	Kyle	76

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
 2017 FIREFIGHTER/PARAMEDIC ENTRY LEVEL
 ELIGIBILITY LIST CERTIFIED - OCTOBER 18, 2017

Ranking	New Ranking	Last Name	First Name	Final Score
87		Dingledine	Benjamin	76
88		Schachtel	Michael	75
89		Pikula	Justin	75
90		Gillespie	Jeremy	75
91		Mlakar	Nathan	74
92		Corse	Justin	74
93		Cooke	Robert	74
94		Carnes	Harry	73
95		Calvitti	Brian	73
96		Benigni	Matthew	73
97		Kamp	Steven	72
98		Woll	Daniel	71
99		Walker	Gregory	71
100		Russo	Vincenzo	70
101		Cavanaugh	Brian	69
102		Maglionico	Alex	68
103		Santry	Daniel	68
104		Panichi	Thomas	67
105		Mancini	Nicholas	67
106		Behm	Patrick	65
107		Herman	Kenneth	65
108		Drop	Steven	63
109		Jeric	Ryan	63
110		Stanczyk	Jeffrey	62
111		Grewel	Gurpreet	61
112		Molder	Mark	59
113		Falcone	Anthony	59
114		Sala	Brian	59
115		Duplaza	Matthew	58
116		Lallitto	Daniel	58
117		Baker	Brandon	57
118		Loeding	Grant	57

Note: According to the City of Shaker Heights Civil Service Rules, Section 5.9, only candidates receiving a passing grade on the examination are eligible for additional credit. Final scores <70 have no additional credit points added.

**CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2021 Fire EXAM COST COMPARISONS
BASED ON PURCHASING 100 EXAMS**

AGENCY	Type of Test	STUDY GUIDE COST	EXAM COST	SCORING SERVICE	SHIPPING	TOTAL (Per 100 Exams)
B-Pad Group, Inc.	Video , Internet link	N/A	\$60.00 per candidate		N/A	\$6,000.00
IPMA	Written	Not Recommended	\$15.00 per exam - 301 NC (TIP) \$97.00 Admin. Fee	\$.50 per sheet \$50 set-up	N/A	\$1,697.00
Personnel Selection Services	Written	Not Recommended	\$20.00 per exam - \$300.00 Setup Fee		N/A	\$2,300.00

EXHIBIT B



Memorandum

To: Members of Civil Service Commission
From: Sandra Middleton, Director of Human Resources
cc: Mayor David E. Weiss
Chief Administrative Officer Jeri E. Chaikin
Date: January 22, 2021
Re: Recommendation for testing company for Fire Entry-Level Process

The last Fire Entry-Level Examination was held on October 8, 2017. One hundred and thirty eight applications were received. One hundred and eighteen candidates took the examination. The Commission on October 18, 2017 certified an eligibility list with 100 candidates. Six Firefighters were hired off the eligibility list before it expired in October 2019. Two anticipatory conditional offers were extended to candidates appearing on the eligibility list prior to its expiration, marking the first time an anticipatory conditional offer was made to a candidate for a vacancy occurring more than a year into the future.

The Fire Chief has received one resignation from a Firefighter who plan to retire in May. Two additional Firefighters will reach the maximum time in DROP program during the second quarter of 2021 and are anticipated to retire. These two firefighters have not submitted a resignation. Currently, there is no active fire eligibility list. In 2021, a fire eligibility list is required to hire new Firefighters to replace vacancies created by retirements.

Due to the pandemic, the City is not recommending having an in-person examination. We did accept two quotes from testing companies that only offer written examinations. The City is recommending using BPAD the same company the Commission approved using for the upcoming Police Lateral-Entry Examination Process. BPAD offers a virtual scenario based test that can be e-mailed to each candidate.

The City is seeking approval from the Commission to use BPAD for the Fire Entry-Level Process.