



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Safety and Public Works Committee Agenda Via Zoom Meeting Due to COVID-19 Public Health Emergency Friday, March 5, 2021, 8:00 a.m.

For the safety of staff and residents, in-person attendance is not permitted. Join the Zoom meeting as a viewer or listener from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device. Join online at <https://zoom.us/j/98995406807?pwd=NTlJeWxkOU5xOU5kM3doRE5xMy9DUT09>, Password: 33553400; Description: Safety and Public Works Committee; or join by phone at 833-548-0282 (toll free); Webinar ID: 974 4098 6646, Password: 33553400. International numbers available at <https://zoom.us/u/abWpZbylVB>.

1. Approval of Minutes for SPW Meeting on February 5, 2021

Documents:

[02052021 SPW MINUTES FINAL DRAFT DOCUMENT.PDF](#)

2. Request for support from the Safety and Public Works Committee to award the 2021 Street Resurfacing Project to Ronyak Paving at a cost of \$1,421,976.40
Presented by: Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works

Documents:

[2021STREETRESURFACINGAWARD \(002\).PDF](#)

3. Adjournment

To request an accommodation for a person with a disability, call the City's ADA Coordinator at 216-491-1440, or Ohio Relay Service at 711 for TTY users.



**SAFETY AND PUBLIC WORKS COMMITTEE MINUTES
FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 5, 2021
8:00 AM
VIA ZOOM MEETING**

Members Present: Robert Zimmerman, Council Chairperson
Sean Malone, Council Member
Carmella Williams, Council Member
Earl Williams, Council Member
Jonathan Hren, Citizen Member
Patricia Speese, Director Public Works
Jeffrey DeMuth, Chief of Police
Patrick Sweeney, Chief of Fire

Others Present: Mayor David E. Weiss
Jeri Chaikin, CAO
Joyce Braverman, Director of Planning
Kara Hamley O'Donnell, Principal Planner
Marilyn Kertis, Recording Assistant

The meeting was called to order by Council Chair Robert Zimmerman at 8:00 am.

APPROVAL OF JANUARY 8, 2021 MEETING MINUTES

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any questions, changes or additions to the February, 2021, Safety and Public Works Committee minutes. There being none, a motion was made by Council Member Carmella Williams, it was seconded, and the minutes were approved.

REQUEST TO AUTHORIZE A GRANT APPLICATION TO, AND TO ACCEPT GRANT FUNDS FROM, THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES' 2021 CLEAN OHIO TRAILS FUND/RECREATIONAL TRAILS PROGRAM FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A MULTI-PURPOSE TRAIL IN THE SHAKER PARKLANDS
Kara Hamley O'Donnell, Principal Planner

The Planning Department is looking to authorize a grant application to, and accept a grant from, the Ohio Department of Natural Resources' 2021 Clean Ohio Trails Fun/Recreational Trails Program for the construction of an 8'- to 10'-wide multipurpose trail in the Shaker Parklands. The proposed trail would be located south of the Lower Lake and parallel with South Park Boulevard from Coventry Road to West Park Boulevard. The estimated project cost, including engineering, environmental studies and construction is \$374,855. The Planning Department is submitting a grant for \$281,141 and a 25% local match is required. The City has already committed \$40,000 in the

2021 General Capital for this project. If granted, an additional commitment of \$53,714 will be required from the City.

The grant requires a fourteen-day community input period prior to the application. Principal Planner O'Donnell and Planning Director Joyce Braverman have already met with various groups including representatives from the Nature Center at Shaker Lakes, Doan Brook Watershed Partnership, and Friends of Lower Lake, who are supportive of the project. The grant requires holding a public meeting before applying for the grant, therefore, the aforementioned groups, along with Bike Cleveland and over 100 neighbors have been informed of a scheduled Virtual Community Zoom Meeting to be held on Tuesday, February 9, 2021, from 6:30 PM – 7:30 PM.

Stakeholders had concerns regarding crossing the path of the wood chip pile, lack of curb space on South Park Blvd., and drainage. They offered an expanded scope of the project including suggesting an in-road bike lane, tree planting, mowing vs. non-mowing, and questioned an increase in storm water run-off from the expanded path.

The goal is to construct a multipurpose trail on the South Side of the Lower Lake that would complete a paved loop around the entire Lower Lake and connect the Shaker Parklands and the Lake-to-Lakes Trail.

There are no sidewalks in this stretch of South Park and residents are forced to walk on the street, use grass, walk on the dirt path, or travel within the roadway, sharing the street with vehicles. This area can become extremely muddy. Links will complete the connections as well as protect environmental resources.

Crosswalks will also be looked at to be more visible at North Woodland, South Park, Larchmere, and Coventry, as well as expanding the sharrows on North Woodland and South Park.

The application is due by March 15, 2021. The Planning Department is currently working on environmental review letters that have to be done in advance of the application. The grant is awarded in November 2021. Planning Department staff are looking at other sources of grant money. The goal is to connect with engineers in the Spring of 2022 and begin work Fall 2022. There should be a quick turnaround time for the project to be completed by the end of 2022.

The Planning Department received estimates from the GPD group for an 8' wide asphalt trail between South Woodland and Coventry. A wider path would be more expensive and pervious paving would double the cost. GPD indicated that asphalt stands up better for this type of project.

Friends of Lower Lake included sketches of possible improvements around the lake including a 10' paved loop trail, neighborhood connections, wet meadows and trees. There were also some concerns about allowing cyclists on the trail and paving the wood chip trail that runs along the lake.

The Planning Department is recommending approval and authorization to submit a grant application to, and to accept a grant from, the Ohio Department of Natural Resources' 2021 Clean Ohio Trails Fun/Recreational Trails Program for the Lower Lake Multipurpose Trail. This request will be for \$281,141 with a \$93,714 local match.

Principal Planner O'Donnell also commented that cyclists and pedestrians often have to travel on the South Park Boulevard roadway which is shared with moving vehicles. The proposed multipurpose trail would do the following: 1. Build missing pedestrian/bicycle connections to complete a paved Lower Lake Loop and connect to the Lake-to-Lakes Trail, Nature Center, Shaker Parklands, and surrounding neighborhoods. 2. Create a connected, accessible, safe trail for pedestrians and cyclists along South Park Boulevard, and 3. Protect environmental resources.

Council Chair Zimmerman commented that this project is really necessary and before he opens the discussion up for questions, he deferred to Council Member Malone to address the sustainability of this project. Council Member Malone indicated that he has been pushing this issue for a long time as it's been a big safety issue. He commented on the great ideas that were presented by Principal Planner O'Donnell and recommended that this project be pushed forward to improve the future of this area so that kids on bicycles, pedestrians, strollers, and those with mobility issues, who currently won't travel in this area are able to do so. True cyclists won't use the path, so it shouldn't be a safety issue, and will be most beneficial for kids on bikes and runners. He recommended that this project should move forward while a broader look is taken for future improvements in the area.

Mayor Weiss commented that this project has been a priority for Council and the Administration for a long time and agreed. The project was in the budget for last year, but was delayed due to the pandemic. Connectivity and safety are both very necessary for this area and neighbors and residents, prior to the pandemic, had commented that there were no sidewalks and that safety was especially an issue for children during the winter time. This is just the beginning of this process to further improve the overall area. He indicated that he hoped to attract further grant money for future improvement projects. There should be plenty of opportunity and this is just the beginning of the process.

Principal Planner O'Donnell added that the location is not set in stone, but will be decided with public input if the grant is received. The Ohio Department of Natural Resources requires a public hearing as a precursor for the grant.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. Council Member Earl Williams asked if there was any negative feedback or objections up to this point from the community members that they have had discussions with. Principal Planner O'Donnell indicated that they sent out over 100 postcards to the residents in the community and have had two emails in support of the project. They are looking forward to the Zoom Meeting scheduled for February 9th for more input and where they expect most of the feedback for the project will be given.

Citizen Member Hren asked if the wood chip pile would remain in the area. Principal Planner O'Donnell indicated that it would and Director Braverman suggested that the path will be an improvement for the entire area; not just where the path goes through the wood chip pile, but apron and pavement improvements will also be added.

Citizen Member Hren also asked if there would be any future grant applications to improve the sidewalks on the opposite side of the road where the driveways are located. Principal Planner O'Donnell indicated that because there are so many trees, this could be very difficult. He then asked if she felt confident that the City would receive the grant and she indicated that this grant is very competitive and not available to many communities, but is hopeful that they will receive it.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any more comments or questions. There being none, he asked for a motion to approve the grant request. A motion was made by Council Member Carmella Williams, it was seconded, and approved.

REQUEST FOR APPROVAL TO AWARD DESIGN CONTRACT TO GPD GROUP FOR DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE RESURFACING OF CHAGRIN BOULEVARD

Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works

Director Speese started out by saying that it was bad timing for this request because of all of the other projects going on in the city. This project is back to back with the Warrensville Center Road Project so it is a busy time for resurfacing but it's either go big or go home! But they are moving forward with the Chagrin Boulevard Resurfacing project to get it done.

As part of ODOT's proposed projects for the State's 2022 fiscal year, Chagrin Boulevard has been programmed for resurfacing from the western city limit to the eastern city limit. She would like the design completed in 2021 and begin construction of the project in 2022. This will be an ODOT Local Public Agency Project (LPA). Their participation in the project is limited to the construction of the roadway and will fund 80% of the work with the City's portion of 20% to resurface Chagrin Blvd. ODOT's construction estimate for resurfacing is \$2,659,996.25. The design fees are the responsibility of the City. The City will also be responsible for items not covered by federal/state funds including full depth road repairs, ADA compliance, ramps, curb and driveway replacement and adjustment of drainage structure castings.

In December of 2020, Public Works requested proposals from 7 firms. The proposals included technical approach and the experience of the firm and their team. In keeping with the Quality Based (QBS) Process, as required for projects using state funding, the proposals were scored on their technical merit, not using fees in the scoring process.

Proposals were received by the GPD Group, ms Consultants and Mannik Smith. Based on the scoring, Public Works interviewed GPD Consultants' project team on January 28, 2021. They are intimately familiar with the project. They have an experienced project team and have also performed the design of Chagrin Boulevard's previous two (2) resurfacing projects with extensive history of the area. Chagrin Boulevard is a federal route which is used extensively in the community but is in horrible shape, therefore, this project needs to move forward quickly.

Public Works is requesting to award the design for the Chagrin Boulevard Resurfacing Project (PID 112472) to GPD Group and the appropriation for \$172, 519 to award the design.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. He expressed his concern about the Public Works Department's capacity (go big or go home) to handle this project. Does this mean other work won't get done? Director Speese indicated that although they will be super busy, they have the staffing to handle the projects and will have no issues transitioning from the Warrensville Center Road Project directly into the Chagrin Boulevard Project.

Council Member Earl Williams thanked Director Speese, but wanted to know if there was any federal funding. Director Speese commented that ODOT runs the federal program, therefore, this

project is federally funded. Typically this should be an 80/20 project, however, it ends up being a 60/40. The City is still responsible to pay for full depth repair, ADA ramps, etc.

Director Speese indicated that this project was initially on the 10-Year Capital Plan for 2023 but is now being funded by the state in 2022, therefore, the design, which is the responsibility of the City should be completed in 2021 so the improvements can be made as soon as possible.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any more comments or questions. There being none, he asked for a motion to approve the request. A motion was made by Council Member Earl Williams, and it was seconded, and approved.

REQUEST TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH CUYAHOGA COUNTY FOR THE REHABILITATION OF THE WARRENSVILLE CENTER ROAD BRIDGE
Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works

The WCR Bridge is weight limited, especially N/B and Public Works reached out to the County who is ultimately responsible for the bridge repair and would like to move this project up. This was taken into consideration with the resurfacing of Warrensville Center Road as they knew this would be coming up. The County has selected a consultant and is currently designing the rehabilitation of the bridge and will begin repairs in 2022. They will be using their Motor Vehicle License Tax Fund for the cost, however, they do request an ordinance from our City allowing them to work in our community. There is a lot of structural damage and Fire Station #2 cannot drive their trucks on the bridge. It won't be paved during the WCR Resurfacing, however, will be resurfaced once the bridge is repaired.

The project will last approximately 18 months and there will be a lot of construction but paving will wait until bridge work is done.

The Department of Public Works is requesting to enter into an agreement with Cuyahoga County so they can proceed with the rehabilitation of the Warrensville Center Road Bridge which is a much needed improvement.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. Council Member Malone questioned since the work will begin in 2022, will it delay any of the other resurfacing projects. Director Speese indicated that the timing should be on target. It won't affect any Public Works employees, since the work will be done by the County.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any more comments or questions. There being none, he asked for a motion to approve the grant request. A motion was made by Citizen Member Hren, it was seconded, and approved.

REQUEST TO APPROVE FIRE DEPARTMENT'S APPLICATION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2020 FEMA ASSISTANCE TO FIREFIGHTERS GRANT FOR REPLACEMENT OF DIESEL EXHAUST SYSTEM AT FIRE STATION ONE.

Patrick Sweeney, Fire Chief

Fire Chief Sweeney indicated that this request has a very short window for this grant which is why it was such a late request to be on the agenda. Both Fire Station One and Fire Station Two have Diesel Exhaust Systems that are vital to maintaining a healthy environment within the stations. The system at Fire Station Two was upgraded to a Direct Capture System in 2013. This type of system is designed to capture emissions with a hose that is connected to the fire truck's tail pipe then exhausted directly to the outside. This system at Station Two works very well.

The Diesel Exhaust System at Fire Station One was designed on a total air exchange concept. With this system, the fire truck's diesel emissions are exhausted into the station's bays and removed with large rooftop fans that pull the diesel emissions out and replace with a total air exchange in the space. This system hasn't worked very well and there have been several issues with its design and mechanics. This system is not ideal as firefighters are subject to breathing the carcinogenic emissions until the air is fully exchanged. This system is not efficient in that when the fire trucks start up in a heated environment, the area needs to continuously be reheated during the winter months.

The Fire Department has been exploring the idea of replacing the current system at Fire Station One with to the Direct Capture System. They solicited input from vendors to swap the system out, knowing there is a grant coming up from FEMA, whose high priority is to reduce carcinogens and reducing the chances of cancer among firefighters. The system would cost approximately \$81,000.

The Fiscal Year 2020 FEMA Assistance to Firefighters Grant Program recently opened up for applications. The grant would provide 90% funding with a required 10% match from the City which would be an estimated \$7200.00.

The Shaker Heights Fire Department is requesting approval from the Safety and Public Works Committee for the Fire Department to submit an application for the Fiscal Year 2020 FEMA Assistance to Firefighters Grant for replacement of the diesel exhaust system at Fire Station One.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. He also indicated that this is a serious issue and if the grant isn't received, what else can be done. Fire Chief Sweeney indicated if it's not received they will submit a request for funds from the Capital Project Fund. He also mentioned that the HVAC system is also an issue for the department which controls the diesel exhaust system so it's all intertwined. Director Speese is looking to improve the HVAC System on living side which is tied into the exhaust system where the apparatus is located.. These improvements along with the grant award would overall improve conditions at the firehouse.

Council Member Malone also asked if there are any ways of measuring the safety of the air and if toxic fumes are ingested by the firefighters? Fire Chief Sweeney has consulted with industrial hygienist partners at University Hospitals to do an analysis of the space. They have indicated they would like to help out but haven't been able to do so yet. They are jammed due to Covid -19 but

still hoping to have it done. Fire Chief Sweeney wanted to have the results before the meeting but the grant just opened up and he wanted to jump on it right away.

Council Member Malone also asked if this is a problem for other departments. Fire Chief Sweeney said that all of the newer departments, including Beachwood are building with the newer system. It's becoming a dominant system across the country.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any more comments or questions. There being none, he asked for a motion to approve the Fire Department's request. A motion was made by Council Member Malone, it was seconded, and approved.

DRAFT



Memorandum

To: Members of Safety & Public Works Committee
From: Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works
cc: Mayor David E. Weiss
Chief Administrative Officer Jeri E. Chaikin
Date: March 5, 2021
Re: 2021 Street Resurfacing Program

On February 12, 2021 the City of Shaker Heights received eight (8) bids for the 2021 Street Resurfacing project. The Contractors and their submitted bids are as follows:

Contractor	
Chagrin Valley Paving	\$1,362,825.82
Ronyak Paving, Inc	\$1,421,976.40
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$1,458,075.72
Perk Company	\$1,464,377.47
Delta Asphalt Company	\$1,521,045.60
Barbicas Construction	\$1,567,205.00
The Shelly Company	\$1,581,619.25
Crossroads Asphalt Recycling	\$1,585,999.00

The Shaker Heights Public Works construction cost estimate was \$1,531,129.92.

The apparent low bidder is Chagrin Valley Paving with a bid total of \$1,362,825.82.

In 2020, Chagrin Valley Paving (CVP) was the apparent lower bidder. The City did not award the contract to CVP for the following reasons:

- Chagrin Valley Paving was awarded the 2015 Street Resurfacing project. In review of that project, Public Works issued a Default of Contract letter because the contractor had been unresponsive.
- Other issues encountered during the 2015 season involved not following our clear direction when resurfacing around Laurel School, causing chaos and mass confusion, overloaded trucks, speeding (48 mph in a 35 mph zone) and employees being rude to residents.

- After increasing our quantities in early August 2015 per the contract, the contractor was non responsive. It was not until Public Works contacted the Bonding Company and issued the Default of Contract letter that Chagrin Valley Paving responded and did the work in late September.
- In general, the quality of work performed under that contract was fair. This is consistent with other municipalities we have spoken to.

After not awarding the 2020 contract, Chagrin Valley Paving had an entire year to provide documentation and start a conversation of how they may have changed their organization and their approach to ensuring future projects in Shaker Heights would be successful. They did not take advantage of this period to try to build a future relationship. Although it is not a contract requirement, CVP did not attend the pre-bid meeting for the 2021 Street Resurfacing project nor the 2020 Street Resurfacing project. They did however, try contacting me by phone during the bid process, which is stated at every pre-bid meeting and in the minutes that we will not speak privately to any bidder, as that would compromise the integrity of the bidding process. All questions need to be put in writing so that the question and answer can be shared with every potential bidder. For a company trying to re-establish a relationship with Shaker Heights, CVP's absence at the pre-bid meeting illustrates a lack of interest in hearing about the project details and hearing from the Public Work's management team.

The second lowest bidder was Ronyak Paving. This contractor has worked on multiple projects for the City (Shaker Blvd. Resurfacing, 2016, 2017 & 2020 Street Resurfacing projects). Additionally, they have performed resurfacing work within the City as a sub-contractor for other utility work. Their quality of work exceeds industry standards, the project managers are responsive and professional. The difference between the lowest and second lowest bidders was \$59,150.58. Ronyak Paving submitted the lowest, best bid which represents less than a four-percent increase from Chagrin Valley Paving's bid.

With the combination a three federal projects into one large project along the Warrensville Center Road corridor and other projects programmed in 2021, Public Works staff will be at peak capacity for the construction season. Given our prior experience with CVP, awarding the 2021 Street Resurfacing to the low bidder would place an additional burden on the Department. Ronyak Paving has consistently proven to be a good partner for the City.

Per the City Charter, the Mayor can award contracts to the "Lowest and Best" bid, however it has been our tradition to take requests for the "Lowest and BEST" bid to Council for their approval.

Based on their bid and previous experience with the City, it is recommended that Ronyak Paving be awarded the 2021 Street resurfacing project at a cost of \$1,421,976.40. As such, we are seeking support from the Safety & Public Works Committee for this request.