



## SHAKER HEIGHTS

### **Civil Service Commission Agenda Shaker Heights City Hall, Conference Room B September 23, 2019 at 3:00 PM**

1. Approval of the February 27, 2019 meeting minutes.

Documents:

[CIVILSERVICEDRAFTMINS 022719.PDF](#)

2. Discussion of Fire Lieutenant process update.
3. Recommendation and approval of testing company for Fire Lieutenant examination.

Documents:

[EXHIBITA-WRITTENEXAMQUOTES.PDF](#)  
[EXHIBITB-ASSESSCTRQUOTES.PDF](#)

4. Recommendation and approval of weights for Fire Lieutenant examination.

Documents:

[EXHIBITC-PROPOSEDTESTWEIGHTS.PDF](#)

5. Recommendation and approval to limit the number of candidates that advance to Lieutenant Assessment Center.
6. Discussion of Police entry-level examination results.
7. Approval of passing grade for Police entry-level examination.
8. Approval of Police eligibility list.
9. Certification of a list of the top 20 names.
10. Schedule next meeting date and time.

To request an accommodation for a person with a disability, call the City's ADA Coordinator at 216-491-1440, or Ohio Relay Service at 711 for TTY users.



**D R A F T**  
**Civil Service Commission Minutes**  
**Wednesday, February 27, 2019**  
**3 P.M.**  
**City Hall Council Chambers**

Members Present: Sandra I. Kiely, Chairperson  
Ron G. Fountain  
Lee A. Trotter  
Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary

Also Present: William Ondrey Gruber, Director of Law  
Jeffrey N. DeMuth, Chief of Police  
James Heath, Assistant Chief of Fire  
Laura Clague, Police Sergeant  
Sandra Middleton, Human Resources Manager  
Patricia McCreary, Human Resources Senior Administrative

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Sandra Kiely at 3:00 p.m.

The first order of business was motion to elect a new Chairperson. Sandra Kiely was re-elected as Chairperson.

\* \* \* \*

**Introduction of Shaker Heights Police Sergeant**

Human Resources Manager Sandy Middleton introduced Laura Clague, Police Sergeant to the Commission as the first female sergeant.

**Approval of April 16, 2018 Meeting Minutes**

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve the April 16, 2018, moved by Commissioner Fountain, and seconded by Commissioner Lee Trotter.

\* \* \* \*

**Discussion of Fire Lieutenant Promotional Process (Exhibit 1)**

Fire Assistant Chief James Heath shared **Exhibit 1**, Fire Lieutenant Promotional Process which will be the same as in 2015. Assistant Chief Heath mentioned the department has two (2) possible Lieutenant retirements on their radar. Fire would like to give a Lieutenant exam in 2019. Assistant Chief Heath stated the timeline is 'tentative' and would like to capture the most out of the two (2) year life span of an eligibility test list and will schedule accordingly. The current tentative timeline starts in June and might shift to late summer or fall.

**CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS**

3400 Lee Road Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120 P 216.491.1400 F 216.491.1465 Ohio Relay Service 711  
**shakeronline.com www.shaker.life**

## **Recommendation and Approval of the Reading List for Fire Lieutenant Promotional Test**

Assistant Chief Heath discussed the hand out for the 2019 Lieutenant Promotional Reading List. Assistant Chief Heath mentioned the list was reviewed from the 2015 promotional and the feedback was elicited from those that had taken the last promotional. Fire personnel reached out to Tom Talcott, Ohio Fire Chiefs Association to review their catalog of books and to see what is currently ‘hot’ books that are being used by other cities. There was one (1) new book added to the list for the Fire Officers Handbook of Tactics (Norman). Assistant Chief Heath stated Fire changed the building construction book from a technical factual book to more of a building construction theory as it applies to fire behavior. Commissioner Ron Fountain agreed the title implies that by using the word “Art”.

Assistant Chief Heath discussed each of books on the reading list. Assistant Chief stated that in the early 1990’s tactics were taught different from what new Firefighters are being taught now and the books on the proposed reading list would allow all the Firefighters to understand the testing and the changes that are taking place.

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve the Reading List for the Fire Lieutenant Promotional written test. Commissioner Fountain moved, and seconded by Commissioner Lee Trotter.

## **Recommendation to Cancel Current Police Entry-Level Eligibility List (Exhibit 2 and Exhibit 3)**

Police Chief Jeffrey DeMuth moved to ***Exhibit 2*** Police Entry-Level Eligibility List. Chief DeMuth mentioned the success of this test and was able to hire nine officers. Chief DeMuth stated that this was the first time a candidate was hired that ranked below 40 on the eligibility list. Ms. Middleton directed the Commission to ***Exhibit 3 – Test Cycle Outcomes***. She reviewed what the past Police entry-level test cycles had produced and advised that this chart shows the past seven year’s cycles.

Chairperson Kiely stated there is a request for the Commission to cancel the current Police Eligibility List, and moved for the Commission to cancel the current Police Eligibility List based on the recommendation by Police Chief DeMuth. Commissioner Ron Fountain moved, and seconded by Commissioner Lee Trotter and unanimously by the group.

## **Overview and Discussion of Recommended Police Entry-Level Process (Exhibit 4 and Exhibit 5)**

Human Resources Manager Sandra Middleton reviewed past Police entry-level examinations. She directed the Commission to ***Exhibit 4 – Police Officer Examination***. Chief DeMuth stated the need to have the test. Presently, the Police Department recently lost three (3) officers with the retirement of a Commander and Sergeant and the resignation of a Detective. Chief DeMuth requested to use the same type of test as the last two Civil Service examinations due to the benefits provided; community input in the process, the caliber of candidates we hired and the positive impact on minority candidates. Chief DeMuth reviewed ***Exhibit 5 – Police Entry-Level Exam Cost*** and recommended that we purchase 50 exams and use the same process.

### **Recommendation and Approval of Testing Company**

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve the IPMA Testing Company. Commissioner Ron Fountain moved, and seconded by Commissioner Lee Trotter and approved.

### **Schedule next meeting date and time.**

Calendars were checked for a future Civil Service Commission meeting and it was scheduled for Monday, June 3, 2019 at 3:30 p.m.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Commissioner Kiely adjourned the meeting at 3:36 p.m.

---

Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary

HRRM/CivilService/AgendasMinutes&Rules/Minutes/19-02-27

# EXHIBIT A

<b>2019 FIRE LIEUTENANT PROMOTIONAL - WRITTEN EXAM COSTS</b>			
	<b>OHIO FIRE CHIEFS' ASSOCIATION</b>	<b>IPMA</b>	<b>I/O SOLUTIONS</b>
<b>Written Test</b>	\$1800 plus \$20 for each candidates	\$395 Fee plus \$10 per question	\$95 per candidate
<b>Misc. Fees</b>	\$5 per department question	Includes 20 test booklets. Each additional booklet is \$26.	
<b>Review of Appeals</b>	Included	Not Included	Included
<b>Total Written Test</b>	<b>\$2,200</b>	<b>\$1,395</b>	<b>\$1,900</b>
<b>*BASED ON 20 APPLICANTS</b>			
<b>** BASED ON 100 QUESTIONS</b>			

# EXHIBIT B

<b>2019 LIEUTENANT PROMOTIONAL ASSESSMENT CENTER COST ESTIMATES</b>		
	<b>OHIO FIRE CHIEFS ASSOCIATION</b>	<b>RAMSEY &amp; ASSOC.</b>
<b>Assessment Center</b>	For 16-24 Candidates (2 days of testing)	\$860 per candidate for 5 or fewer \$760 per candidate for 6-7 \$710 per candidate for 8-9 \$610 per candidate for 10-20
<b>Misc. Fees</b>		
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>\$17,600</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b>PROJECTIONS BASED ON 24 LIEUTENANTS TO ASSESSMENT CENTER</b>		

## EXHIBIT C

### PROMOTIONAL EXAMINATION TEST WEIGHTS WITH 2019 RECOMMENDATION

	<b>2019 Proposed Weights (Lieutenant)</b>	<b>2015 Weights (Battalion Chief &amp; Lieutenant)</b>	<b>2011 (Battalion Chief)</b>	<b>2010 (Lieutenant)</b>
Written Exam	40%	40%	40%	40%
Assessment Center	60%	60%	60%	60%