



**Recreation Committee Minutes  
Wednesday, February 1, 2023  
6 P.M.  
Via Teleconference – Zoom**

Members Present: Ifeolu Claytor, Council Member Chairperson  
Earl Williams, Council Member  
Alexandria Nichols, Recreation Department Director  
Sean Malone, City Council Member  
Jonathan Kraft, Citizen Member  
Jeri Chaikin, CAO  
Tina Nobile, Citizen Member  
Alison Bibb-Carson, School Board Member  
David E. Weiss, Mayor

Others Present: Jan Devereaux, League of Women Voters Representative  
Quiana Player, Business Services Manager, Shaker Recreation Dept.  
Thomas Lach, Aquatics Coordinator, Shaker Recreation Dept.

**CALL TO ORDER**

Ifeolu Claytor, Council Member Chairperson

The meeting was called to order at 6:02 pm by Council Chairperson, Ifeolu Claytor

**Review and Approval December 7, 2022 Minutes**

Ifeolu Claytor, Council Member, Chairperson

It was moved by Councilman Williams and seconded by citizen member Jonathan Kraft that the minutes from December 2022 be approved as written.

**Discussion on Operating Hours for Thornton Park Pool When School in Session**

[Pool Operating Hours When School in Session Presentation](#)

Thornton Park Pool is open from Memorial Day through Labor Day. When school is in session, both early and late outdoor pool season, there is a struggle to have enough high school students staff the pool for community use. There have been occasions in the past couple of years when the pool was closed due to an inability to staff lifeguard shifts. This presentation is to share these challenges with the Recreation Committee and get feedback on the possibility of closing the pool on weekdays when school is in session.

**Questions:**

Is the City's insurance impacted by the staffing challenge?

**Answer:** The City's insurance coverage is unaffected by the staffing shortages due to certain attractions and parts of the pool being closed when there are no lifeguards available.

**CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS**

3400 Lee Road Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120 P 216.491.1400 F 216.491.1465 Ohio Relay Service 711  
[shakeronline.com](http://shakeronline.com) [www.shaker.life](http://www.shaker.life)

Does the City pay for the lifeguards re-certifications?

**Answer:** Yes, we pay for current staffs certifications when they get renewed. All new lifeguards that take the certification classes that The City of Shaker Heights offer are charged a \$150 dollar fee.

Is there an incentive program for current lifeguards to refer their friends to sign up and become lifeguards for the City?

**Answer:** Yes, in 2022 there was an incentive program. The Recreation Departments plans to offer this for 2023 as well.

On average how many people took advantage of the open pool hours?

**Answer:** Most of the pool attendance is weather based; a typical day there could be between 200 to 400 visitors throughout a day. On a very hot day there could be between 600 to 1,000 visitors. When school is in session, the afterschool hours only have about 30 and 50 visitors.

What is the required guard to swimmer ratio?

**Answer:** The American Red Cross recommends a 1 to 25 ratio.

Has the pool historically been open on a full time operating schedule when school is in session?

**Answer:** Yes, the pool schedule has largely remained the same. The staffing shortage has always been an issue but since the pandemic the situation has gotten worse as far as lifeguard availability.

What are the minimum lifeguard requirements when people are in the pool?

**Answer:** The First Aid station has to have two lifeguards at all time. The minimum for the pool deck would be two lifeguards; that would be operating without the lazy river, toddler pool or the diving well.

The Recreation Committee was supportive in the decision to change the pool hours based on unavoidable staffing shortages. The committee would like to revisit the pool hours discussion if any point there is a large influx of lifeguards and the staffing shortages are no longer an issue with pool operating hours when school is in session.

### **Request for Agreement with First Data**

Shaker Recreation Department has been using registration software services for over 10 years which requires a credit card processor that is compatible with the registration service provider. Credit card processing has been done through Elavon for over ten years and was compatible with the previous two registration system providers. Recreation processes program fees in excess of \$800,000 annually paid for by credit cards. Accepted credit cards are Visa, MasterCard, and Discover.

Credit card processing is done through secondary processors who are merchant services liaisons between merchant banking and business vendors. Recreation is recommending an agreement with First Data to process credit cards through Recreation both online and in-person. The Recreation Department's current credit card processor is Elavon for which there is no written agreement.

In 2016, the Recreation Department discontinued on-site credit card readers and staff manually enters the cards information due to Payment Card Industry (PCI) standards which would not allow the credit cards to be processed over the City's computer network. Switching registration providers and new technology will allow Recreation staff to now process credit cards through credit card

readers that will be separate from the City’s network on a separate internet connection. First Data is the recommended provider of credit card processing services through RecDesk because the system is designed for First Data as the credit card processing provider.

All credit card processing providers charge fees that are a part of doing business and these credit card processing fees are budgeted annually into the operating budget. Credit card processing fees are based upon the volume of transactions, transaction type, and type of credit card.

Shaker Recreation has been paying fees to Elavon on a monthly basis and these costs are a percentage of the transaction costs for each transaction paid for by credit card. The table below shows the credit card processing costs data for a calendar year from September 2021 through August 2022 to demonstrate the fee charges to the City. Fees paid to Elavon are over \$25,000 annually.

Credit Card Processing Table

Month	Total Sales	Credit Card Processing Fees
September 2021	\$22,429.09	\$824.09
October 2021	\$22,058.82	\$869.02
November 2021	\$16,037.50	\$664.31
December 2021	\$ 52,953.50	\$1,840.81
January 2022	\$ 70,626.61	\$2,266.20
February 2022	\$ 84,758.39	\$2,687.12
March 2022	\$121,083.09	\$3,455.42
April 2022	\$ 84,974.19	\$2,572.19
May 2022	\$ 68,641.45	\$2,206.10
June 2022	\$ 72,643.81	\$2,790.28
July 2022	\$ 96,391.90	\$2,825.35
August 2022	\$124,158.00	\$3,558.81
	\$836,756.35	\$26,559.70

This table shows the total sales and credit card processing by month. There is a natural seasonality to recreation programs which is why program revenue varies by month. Other City departments use credit card readers but do not have the volume of sales transactions so they do not have written agreements. For those departments who accept credit cards, First Data is the provider and Recreation would like to use the same provider.

Clover credit card readers are currently being used in Building and Housing as well as in Finance and these would be used by Recreation as a part of the First Data agreement. First Data has agreed to honor the same fee terms that the City is paying to Elavon so the cost to the City for credit card processing fees is not expected to increase and is already in the budget. Adding credit card readers on site will expedite transactions at the pool and the rink which are the bulk of our in-person transactions.

Credit card processing fees for recreation transactions exceed \$25,000 annually and are typically between \$25,000 and \$30,000 per year. Changing from Elavon to First Data to process credit card transactions requires a three year service agreement with this provider. All agreements that exceed \$25,000 are required to have City Council approval. This agreement is sole source because First Data is the only compatible provider for credit card processing through our registration system. It is also a personal services agreement because Recreation is requesting a specific and necessary service based upon the requirements set forth by RecDesk, the registration system. Sole source and personal services agreements are exempt from public bidding and formal quotes.

**Questions:**

Would the transaction process be faster with new credit card readers?

**Answer:** Yes, this would be a major efficiency when processing transactions. Currently all credit cards are manually entered for in-person transactions and this is a slow process which leads to a long line for customers waiting to be served.

Will the community be able to use Apple Pay and similar services?

**Answer:** Yes, the new credit card readers will have the capability to process Bluetooth transactions such as Apple Pay, Google Pay, and Samsung Pay. Credit cards can be inserted, swiped, or tapped. Additionally, American Express cards can also be processed with First Data as the credit card processing service.

Do the residents pay any fees over and above the cost of the program fee when paying with a credit card.?

**Answer:** Registration fees, pool pass fees, and facility rental fees are the only cost to people when paying by credit card. Recreation fees include a small percentage for administrative costs which is included in the cost of the program, pass, or facility rental.

The Recreation Committee was supportive of this initiative as it will tremendously improve transaction efficiency and the customer experience when paying for a program or service in-person. This item was moved by council member Earl Williams and seconded by citizen member Jonathan Kraft to approve the contract with First Data. The committee unanimously voted to recommend that City Council approve this service agreement with First Data. The contract request moved forward to the Finance Committee and City Council

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:58 pm.

---

Ifeolu Claytor, Council Member  
Chairperson, Recreation Committee