The Council of the City of Shaker Heights met in a regular session at 7:35 p.m., Mayor David E. Weiss presiding.

Council Members Present: Mr. Roeder
Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams
Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman
Mr. Malone
Mrs. Moore

Council Members Absent: None

Audio of this meeting may be found here through June 30, 2020.

Mayor Weiss stated that tonight’s meeting is unprecedented for several reasons in light of the current circumstances that are going on in our country right now. This is the first all telephonic meeting to his knowledge that we have ever done. We are doing this in an unprecedented way as participants, and the public alike, are all attending this meeting remotely due to the current COVID-19 public health emergency as declared by the Centers for Disease Control (CDC) and the State of Ohio, including the stay at home order issued on March 22, 2020 by the Ohio Director of Health. On a personal note, he hopes that all of the people in the community and indeed the country, as well as those participating in this meeting, as well as those listening in, are healthy and well. We hope to be able to get back to our in person meetings as soon as it is safe to do so. In light of these unprecedented times, this Council meeting is being conducted with special procedures. The meeting is being conducted remotely by conference call with a listen only line for the public and a participant line for Council members, staff and anyone else needing to make a presentation or answer Council’s questions. One note to Council members or staff because we cannot see them, but only hear them, who are participating in the meeting tonight, if they have to leave the meeting temporarily for any reason, please text Chief Administrative Officer Jeri E. Chaikin when they leave and return so we can have that recorded in the record, particularly for Council members. If you are on the participant line please mute your phone until you speak to avoid any background noise. When participants do speak he asked they state their name each time so it is clear who is speaking, and speak slowly and clearly so everyone can understand them. For everyone, both participants and the public in general, the agenda and material for the meeting can be found on the City’s website at
www.shakeronline.com. For the record, the public was given an opportunity to provide comments and ask questions in advance of the meeting and we will read those into the record during the course of the meeting. If you do have questions that arise during the meeting, you can feel free to send them to CAO Chaikin at jeri.chaikin@shakeronline.com and we will answer them as soon as possible either at the end of the meeting or following the meeting. Her phone number and email are also listed at the bottom of the agenda so following the meeting if you have any questions or comments, you may feel free to reach out to her. The procedure for the meeting tonight, our goal, is to keep it as similar as we are able to meetings that we hold in person. After the approval of minutes from prior meetings he will ask CAO Chaikin to read into the record any comments or questions submitted in advance concerning any agenda items. This is consistent with our public in person meetings where we start with public comment on any agenda items. After public comments are submitted on agenda items, he will announce each item. For each item, staff members will make a presentation and he will ask Council if they have any questions or comments. For Council he will ask initially for them to speak sequentially in the order of the roll call to avoid speaking over one another. If others have comments they can go back to add them. If Council members have questions for staff members he will ask the staff member to respond. Once Council has fully discussed the item if it is the will of the body, he will call for a motion and a second and take any action as needed at that point. After all agenda items have been addressed there is an opportunity for CAO Chaikin to read into the record any comments or questions submitted by the public in advance of the meeting on any topics not on the agenda. This is consistent with our procedure for public in person meetings. Although we typically do not necessarily answer questions during the meeting, if there are ready answers we will endeavor to do so tonight and if not then we will follow up after the meeting.

*   *   *   *

It was moved by Mrs. Moore, and seconded by Ms. Anne Williams, that the minutes of the special meeting of February 10, 2020, be approved as recorded.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried

*   *   *   *

It was moved by Mr. Roeder, and seconded by Ms. Anne Williams, that the minutes of the regular meeting of February 24, 2020, be approved as recorded.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried
The Mayor stated that under these unusual circumstances we appreciate everyone’s patience. This is the first time we have had a Council meeting by teleconference so hopefully all will go smoothly, but if there are some bumps in the road we appreciate everyone’s patience and understanding.

The Mayor asked the Clerk of Council to read into the record public comments received on any of the agenda items.

Ms. Chaikin stated that no public comments were received on any agenda items by email or by phone.

* * * *

**Resolution No. 20-18, by Mr. Earl Williams, proclaiming April 2020 as Fair Housing Month in Shaker Heights, recognizing and celebrating the 52nd anniversary of the Federal Fair Housing Act, and reiterating the City’s support for housing without discrimination in the City and the maintenance of an inclusive community.**

Council member Mr. Earl Williams read aloud the resolution proclaiming April 2020 as Fair Housing Month in Shaker Heights, recognizing and celebrating the 52nd anniversary of the Federal Fair Housing Act, and reiterating the City’s support for housing without discrimination in the City and the maintenance of an inclusive community.

It was moved by Mr. Earl Williams, and seconded by Mrs. Moore, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Resolution No. 20-18 be placed upon its final enactment.

| Roll Call: | Ayes: | Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams |
|           |      | Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams |
|           |      | Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore |

| Nays: | None |

Motion Carried

Moved by Mr. Earl Williams, and seconded by Mrs. Moore, that Resolution No. 20-18 be enacted as read.

| Roll Call: | Ayes: | Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams |
|           |      | Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams |
|           |      | Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore |

| Nays: | None |

Resolution Adopted
Ordinance No. 20-19, by Mr. Earl Williams, approving and authorizing execution of a Purchase Agreement under the City’s Side Lot Program, for the sale of the City-owned property adjacent to and immediately south of 3625 Stoer Road, Shaker Heights, Ohio (PP# 736-22-063), for a purchase price of $1.00, authorizing the disposition of City-owned property without competitive bidding, and declaring an emergency.

Kamla Lewis, Neighborhood Revitalization Director, stated that in February 2020, Council approved changes to the City’s side lot program. The goal of the changes was to streamline the application process for the applicant and make it more affordable for them to acquire these City owned lots and by doing so saving the City the ongoing costs of maintaining these properties. The main changes included a set price of $1 per lot, no requirement for any improvements to the lot and that applications would go straight to Council for approval. This application is from the residents at 3625 Stoer to acquire a City-owned vacant lot directly south of their home to add fencing, a playhouse and a therapeutic pacing area. They bought their home in December 2019. The City acquired the vacant lot in April 2014 through the tax foreclosure process. There was never a structure on the vacant lot. This item is requested as an emergency and with a suspension of the rules to enable the applicants to immediately commence the needed steps to survey and consolidate the lot with their home.

Mr. Roeder stated that it is good to see this new side lot approval process in place. This is a more efficient, and faster way of doing this.

It was moved by Mr. Earl Williams, and seconded by Mrs. Moore, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-19 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried

Moved by Mr. Earl Williams, and seconded by Mrs. Moore, that Ordinance No. 20-19 be enacted as read.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Ordinance Enacted

*   *   *   *   *
Ordinance No. 20-20, by Mrs. Moore, approving and authorizing execution of a Purchase Agreement under the City’s Side Lot Program, for the sale of the City-owned property located at 2583-85 Kendall Road, Shaker Heights, Ohio (PP# 736-31-017), for a purchase price of $1.00, authorizing the disposition of City-owned property without competitive bidding, and declaring an emergency.

Kamla Lewis, Neighborhood Revitalization Director, stated that this application is from the resident at 2584 Cheshire Road to acquire a City-owned vacant lot behind his home located at 2583 Kendall Road, add a greenhouse, and raised bed for a vegetable and flower garden. The applicant bought his home in July 2019. The City acquired the vacant lot in September 2013 from HUD. The previous structure was demolished in 2012. This item is requested as an emergency and with a suspension of the rules to enable the applicant to immediately commence the needed steps to survey and consolidate the lot with his home.

Mayor Weiss stated that that the revised side lot program seems to be working well and he looks forward to seeing more of these.

It was moved by Mrs. Moore, and seconded by Mr. Roeder, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-20 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried

Moved by Mrs. Moore, and seconded by Mr. Roeder, that Ordinance No. 20-20 be enacted as read.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Ordinance Enacted

*   *   *   *

Ordinance No. 20-21, by Mr. Zimmerman, granting a permanent easement to Dominion Energy Ohio (DEO) on City-owned property between Warrensville Center Road and Shaker Boulevard, that is part of Parcel Numbers 733-12-016 and 733-23-020, to relocate the existing gas pipeline, and declaring an emergency.

Patricia Spences, Public Works Director, stated that Dominion Energy Ohio (DEO) has a gas main that runs parallel to the Warrensville Center Road bridge east and westbound near Shaker Boulevard. Warrensville Center Road will be undergoing significant improvements starting with resurfacing next year, but we requested that DEO replace this main so that the bridge which has been weight limited for some
time could be repaired by the County. In order for DEO to do this they had to relocate the gas main which required an easement on City property. This item is requested as an emergency and with a suspension of the rules so that the project can move forward.

Council member Mr. Zimmerman stated that this item was reviewed and unanimously approved by the Safety and Public Works Committee.

Council member Mr. Malone asked about the location of the easement in the event the City wanted to do anything with that parcel of land, if the easement could be moved if necessary and how difficult that would be.

William M. Ondrey Gruber, Law Director, stated that the easement language has not been finalized. It is fairly typical to have language that would provide the City some rights to be able to have it moved at the utility’s cost for a public infrastructure project. It may be a limited right but certainly something we will be exploring.

Director Speese stated that typically these are placed deep enough so that it shouldn’t be a problem, but this will be discussed with DEO.

Council member Mrs. Moore stated that the memo distributed states it does not appear any trees will be removed as a result of this project. Sometimes unintentionally with gas line projects major roots are severed. She wanted to be sure that if trees die potentially as a result of this project, that DEO will be liable for their replacement or cost of replacement.

Director Speese stated that two or three years ago we revised the right-of-way permits. DEO now must video underground utilities, and are also responsible for all the trees and root structure and their replacement if they fail within a couple years. They have been very good about it.

It was moved by Mr. Zimmerman, and seconded by Mr. Earl Williams, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-21 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call:  Ayes:  Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams  
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams  
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore  

Nays:  None  

Motion Carried

Moved by Mr. Zimmerman, and seconded by Mr. Earl Williams, that Ordinance No. 20-21 be enacted as read.
Roll Call:  Ayes:  Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams  
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams  
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore  
Nays:  None

Ordinance Enacted

*   *   *   *

Ordinance No. 20-22, by Mr. Zimmerman, amending Ordinance No. 19-122 an ordinance appropriating funds from the General Capital Fund 0401 for the acquisition of equipment and various repairs and improvement projects for various City facilities by appropriating an additional $39,260 from the General Capital Fund 0401 for City Hall Fire Alarm Replacement, and declaring an emergency.

Patricia Speese, Public Works Director, stated that the City Hall fire alarm system was last upgraded in 1970. Over the last 40 years there have been significant changes and improvements to the requirements for fire safety. We went out to bid for this project and the bids came in higher than anticipated for construction costs. We refined the plan and went back out to bid. The second bids came in over the State of Ohio's threshold for prevailing wage, so we had to rebid a third time as a prevailing wage project which brought the costs up significantly. We need an additional appropriation of $39,260 in order for the project to move forward. Fire Chief Patrick Sweeney stressed the importance of this project going forward, especially with upcoming construction at City Hall, which is when buildings are most vulnerable. This improvement is important to protect City Hall. This item is being requested as an emergency so we may enter into a contract immediately.

Council member Mr. Zimmerman stated that this item was reviewed and unanimously supported by the Safety and Public Works Committee. There were a few questions, including one from Mr. Malone who asked about the increased costs. It was recognized that this was clearly a matter of health and safety and something we needed to support.

Council member Mr. Malone stated that unfortunately, it seemed due to the intervening time it increased the construction costs so it is a little more expensive, but this is a very important project and we need to move forward with it.

Council member Mr. Roeder stated that he was surprised by the cost of this. He knows we had to come back twice to increase the cost, but upon reading the memo that was distributed and having conversations with staff at City Hall of course this is something we have to do. It is important for the safety and he understands the historic nature of our building and complexity of some of our systems as well as providers being very busy. Those factors did increase the costs. This project was bid and it is an important project for us to do for safety.

Council member Mr. Earl Williams asked if this will affect the Fire Department’s temporary housing at City Hall. As a result of the COVID-19 order we need to accommodate them for a while.

Director Speese stated that this will not affect the Fire Department.
Council member Mrs. Moore stated that this project will begin soon and wondered if because it has been rebid three times if the Coronavirus epidemic will impact the construction and scheduling.

Director Speese stated that as far as we know of as today it should not have any impact, but things change every day with COVID-19. It will take several weeks to get a contract in place so it could change but we will get this done as soon as humanly possible.

It was moved by Mr. Zimmerman, and seconded by Ms. Carmella Williams, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-22 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams  
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams  
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried

Moved by Mr. Zimmerman, and seconded by Ms. Carmella Williams, that Ordinance No. 20-22 be enacted as read.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams  
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams  
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Ordinance Enacted

*   *   *   *

Ordinance No. 20-23, by Mr. Malone, administrative acceptance of the approval of the City Planning Commission and confirmation of the granting of a Conditional Use Permit for the construction of an assisted living and memory care facility, with Confluent Development LLC, located at 16900 Van Aken Boulevard, pursuant to Section 1213.05 of the City's Zoning Code.

Joyce Braverman, Director of Planning, stated that the City Planning Commission approved a conditional use permit for this project at their meeting earlier this evening with conditions, including a final landscape plan to be approved by staff including the eastern border with the Greenbrier, an ornamental fence in that location, final review by the Architectural Review Board, and the submission of a subdivision plat. This is for an assisted living facility and conditional use permits require Council confirmation. Confluent will construct a 108-unit, three-story assisted living facility which will employ about 75 employees. The City did execute a Development and Use Agreement with the developer to purchase the City-owned lot, construct this project, and to realign Winslow Road and Winslow Court intersection.
Ms. Braverman stated that at the Planning Commission meeting Council member Ms. Carmella Williams asked how residents could get on the waiting list. The operator says they will establish an onsite sales presence about 6 months prior to completion of construction where residents can place a refundable deposit and establish a priority list. Council member Ms. Carmella Williams also asked if there will be job opportunities for residents. Ms. Braverman stated that it is our goal that all associates come from Shaker Heights and the surrounding communities. Ms. Braverman stated that Harbor Chase is not associated with the Jennings senior facilities here in Cleveland. This item is requested with a suspension of the rules in order for project construction to start in October 2020.

Council member Mr. Malone stated that he believes all of Council heard the presentation at the City Planning Commission meeting earlier this evening, and he hopes he was able to express some of the concerns he heard from a few of them about the extraordinary circumstances we are in holding these meetings telephonically in short order. He does not want there to be, and he believes none of them want there to be, the perception that the public has not been fully apprised of this. This project has been ongoing for quite some time so he asked a few questions along those lines. There will be final approval on the eastern boundary with Greenbrier and final discussions with staff and the developer in hopes that we can create a better buffer, and allow some trees to grow to a greater height. Overall he thinks this is a very good project for the City and has the potential to eliminate or reduce dramatically a lot of our debt over time once the project is in full use and generating income tax for the City. It is consistent in general in his view with the character of the residential neighborhood and looks forward to seeing the project continue.

Council member Mr. Roeder stated that he heard the City Planning Commission vet through the different questions from the community in terms of a variety of issues from parking to headlights and he respects their judgment on that issue. He heard in the City Planning Commission meeting that this would be $2.9 million in income tax and $760,000 in real estate. He wanted to confirm the $2.9 million is the total anticipated gross receipts of the employees and the City would actually get its percentage of that which might be somewhere around $70,000. He also asked when we would expect the City to receive that revenue, and if they will ramp up the employment with the first year of operation having a slightly smaller number. He wanted to know at what point do we currently anticipate those numbers would be contributing to the City, library and school tax base.

Director Braverman stated that is correct. We anticipate close to $65,000 annually in estimated income tax receipts as the City’s share of the $2.9 million income tax. This would be when the project is fully completed. The same thing is true with the property tax. That number is when the project is fully completed.

Mayor Weiss clarified that the $2.9 million is annual payroll. He would expect there would be a ramping up as they begin operations as people start to move in. Property tax will occur faster on the next reappraisal date.

William M. Ondrey Gruber, Law Director, stated that for the property tax the completion will be essentially when the certificate of occupancy is issued and when all improvements are made to the property. It will go back on the property tax roll, but there will be a year lag because the property taxes will be for that year which are owed for the following year. It depends on if there is substantial completion this year or not. If we assume substantial completion next year then the 2021 taxes would be billed in 2022. There may be some incremental increase for 2020 which would appear on the 2021 taxes. We don’t know yet. It depends on the timing of the project. Income taxes may lag going up over time as it gets full...
occupancy. They may not have a full staff at the beginning. Income tax may increase over time whereas property tax will be set at the point of time when they are completed with the building.

Director Braverman stated that opening is scheduled for April 2022 with full occupancy expected in 2025.

Council member Ms. Anne Williams stated that she was a little concerned with putting this on first reading in terms of getting public comment and input given the unusual circumstances we are in, but she listened to the City Planning Commission and is really impressed with the amount of public comment that was received, and the number of people who responded from the Greenbrier and Avalon Station. She credits the Planning Department for the outreach because it is always difficult and especially difficult when you can’t have a public meeting. She asked about the windows and the variance for the percentage. In the diagram the windows looked perfectly reasonable in size and she couldn’t imagine them being much bigger to conform to code.

Director Braverman stated that is part of the commercial mixed use section of the Zoning Code aimed at storefront windows. It talks about the amount of glazing or glass and really deals more with how much glass a storefront window would have. The windows that are proposed are in keeping with the type you would see in apartment buildings up and down Van Aken Boulevard. These are not small, undersized or a question of whether there won’t be enough light, but the code is written for a commercial building versus this type of building.

Council member Ms. Carmella Williams stated that she is glad for the work of the Planning Department and the diligence of the developer.

Council member Mr. Earl Williams stated that this is a fair housing City and asked to what extent the fair housing ordinance will affect those who need to be in these units for medical reasons who may be considered disabled and how HUD laws come in to play, as well as those who need assisted living who don’t become disabled may be affected by these laws. He asked if we could get something in writing from the operator on how they intend to operate in fair housing cities. He is concerned about those who believe a medical or disabled circumstance may trump those who might compete with trying to secure a unit.

Director Gruber stated that is a complicated question. He does not believe the fair housing laws apply to the memory care portion and he does not recall if it applies to assisted living facilities, but he will find out and report back. Both uses are heavily regulated by the State of Ohio and require licenses. The state has strong guidelines on how the operator can solicit or accept residents. This is a private pay facility so it will be for those who can afford to live there. Certainly, we have a public accommodations law in Shaker Heights similar to the County which would apply to prevent discrimination to employees and residents, but that is not a fair housing law.

Council member Mr. Earl Williams stated that he understands that some federal funds are being used to support this project so there is concern about the methodology to select individuals living there and asked to what extent they have used that funding with their development.

Director Braverman stated that she is not aware of any federal funding, but will double check.

Council member Mr. Zimmerman stated that the only thing before us at this moment is the standard for the conditional use permit so he thinks they should stay focused on that. When he served on the City Planning Commission he had the opportunity to work on this project. He is glad to see that it is coming
to fruition and that it was unanimously adopted by the City Planning Commission. This is a good project and it adds a lot to the community not only in terms of tax revenue but also a very significant need for people who need this type of housing and who would like to stay in the community or interested in moving to Shaker because of this additional product. It certainly should not go without saying that development projects may be in peril in this environment right now and we have one. It seems to him that this has been properly vetted by the City and the appropriate committees and commission. He thinks his colleague Council member Ms. Anne Williams made a good point that normally when a project like this is going into a neighborhood you would want to do everything you can to solicit community input. You would perhaps not want to consider it on first reading, but as a longtime member of the City Planning Commission he can’t remember the last time there was so much community input in a project. He thinks a lot of that input was incorporated into the project itself. He heard that happen in real time by his former colleagues. He applauds the members and staff for making that happen. While this is certainly an unusual circumstance by not being able to do this in person, he thinks the analysis, vetting and process is working quite well. He intends to support this.

Council member Mrs. Moore stated that in the beginning she was a little concerned about having to assimilate a lot of information and having the City Planning Commission meeting directly precede the Council meeting so they were assimilating this instantaneously. She was very impressed with the amount of public input that was read into the record by Director Braverman and the detail of it. She is very supportive of this issue and feels she could vote on all three agenda items based on the information she has privy to. She asked about the property tax yield of about $760,000 when fully built out and the Payments in Lieu of Taxes (PILOTs) that are deposited and fund the urban renewal bond premiums the City pays every year. She wanted to know if when it is fully built out if it would yield about $570,000/year and if so would it erase the current subsidies or at least a portion for the urban renewal bond.

Finance Director John Potts stated that we have looked at that and when everything is ramped up by 2025 or toward the end of 2024 pulling in the $570,000 would put the City in a surplus position with respect to the debt service on the bonds if everything stays on target.

Council member Mrs. Moore stated that she knows that the residents of the Greenbrier were very concerned that even though there are no residential units on the first floor, when cars come into the parking lot on the eastern border of the development headlights would shine into the Greenbrier and the memory care unit. She wanted to make sure the landscaping buffer and trees were enough, along with the ornamental fence to really be a true visual buffer so that both buildings would not feel negatively impacted by the traffic and without the landscaping there.

Director Braverman stated that arborvitae shrubs and holly bushes are both evergreen bushes. They will be planted at four feet high and will be like a living wall. They will be rather dense so headlights should not penetrate through that buffer.

Council member Mrs. Moore asked whether as discussed in the City Planning Commission meeting it would be better to eliminate a few parking spaces and enlarge the island creating a larger growth place for the trees to become bigger or whether the trees would serve a better purpose by being put into the eastern buffer with the fence and arborvitae. She asked if the arborvitae go all along the eastern border where would the trees go. It seemed the developer wanted to keep all parking spaces no matter what. She is concerned they will plunk a few trees between the arborvitae and it won’t really do any good for the trees and won’t enhance the landscaping buffer.
Director Braverman stated that staff agrees with her concerns and would like to explore the options and involve the City forester and arborist to make sure that the evergreen buffer would be continuous and that the trees would have enough space to grow.

It was moved by Mr. Malone, and seconded by Mr. Zimmerman, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-23 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried

Moved by Mr. Malone, and seconded by Mr. Zimmerman, that Ordinance No. 20-23 be enacted as read.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Ordinance Enacted

*   *   *   *

Ordinance No. 20-24, by Mr. Malone, approving and authorizing execution of an Amendment to the Purchase, Development and Use Agreement entered into on August 30, 2019 with Confluent Development, LLC, in order for the City to contribute a portion of the cost of an underground storm water detention system required by NEORSD by reducing the purchase price, and to authorize the transfer of a portion of City-owned property on Winslow Court behind Shaker Town Center to Confluent, and declaring an emergency.

Joyce Braverman, Director of Planning, stated that this is a request to amend the purchase agreement. This site has long been a subject to development agreements. In 2007 Heartpoint defaulted on their development agreement. In 2016 we entered into an agreement with Payne & Payne to build townhomes which due to a weak market for townhomes and poor quality was terminated in September 2018. This site is part of the Shaker Town Center urban renewal area. Confluent plans to build 108 units. The project sale price is $1.45 million which is $13,500 per unit. We suggested the purchase price be reduced by $150,000 which would result in a purchase price of approximately $1.3 million. Annual payroll is estimated at $2.9 million at full build out and there will be PILOTs on this property. The property tax is estimated at $760,000 annually of which 75% would go to PILOTs. Confluent is partnering with Harbor Retirement Associates to manage this facility. Through the due diligence and the development agreement process there was an issue with the flood plain where a small portion of the site was located in the flood plain. Confluent hired an engineer to make application to FEMA and had that section removed. After the project is built there is an additional application to FEMA that is required. In terms of storm water detention the NEORSD ruled that onsite storm water detention is required and the cost of an
underground system is estimated to be $360,000. The City is recommending the purchase price be reduced by $150,000 so the City would share in the cost which was not anticipated. The odd shape parcel is proposed to be squared off in the rear of the site which will provide additional land for the Confluent development and straighten the Winslow Road right-of-way. Confluent will construct the road at their expense. We are expecting ground to be broken in October 2020. In order to facilitate and approve this project staff recommends amendments to the following amendments to the purchase and development agreement: reducing the purchase price by a maximum of $150,000 to pay for a portion of no more than 50% of the cost of the construction of the underground storm water detention system, and transferring a portion of the City property on Winslow Road to Confluent, as well as the approval of the vacation and dedication plat to straighten Winslow Road. This item is requested as an emergency and with a suspension of the rules so the property closing can be expedited in order to allow Confluent to proceed with an October 2020 ground breaking.

Mayor Weiss stated that we have been working with Confluent and their affiliates and operator for quite some time. They have been extremely professional and diligent in their handling of this project. In the course of any kind of large scale development project like this there are invariably things that neither party anticipated at the time the purchase price was negotiated. Director Braverman has mentioned a number of costs that were unanticipated at the outset, like the flood plain, and underground storm water detention. Much of the reconfiguration of Winslow Road was at our request because we thought it made sense both from a traffic standpoint and was really a win-win benefit. It provides a little extra land that provided a better site plan for Confluent and also resulted in Confluent agreeing to pay those costs. There are always as you go through this process on the ledger debits and credits on each side. At the end of the day we thought the adjustment to the purchase price, particularly in light of the fact that the number of units that were able to be developed on this project exceeded our original estimates so the overall purchase price is already in excess of what we anticipated originally. We thought this was a fair compromise taking into account a lot of different factors as well as the relationship and circumstances under which we are trying now to move forward on this project. We think this is good for the community, and the City economically. There are lots of requests from residents for additional quality places to help house aging parents and others so we thought this was the right thing to do to modify the agreement. On a wide range of things from property tax levels to the NEORSD, Confluent has raised fair and reasonable comments in light of unanticipated events and have been responsive to our comments. Thus far they have been a very good developer to be working with.

Council member Mr. Malone stated that the City Planning Commission did not discuss the flood plain issue in any detail so he was hoping there could be an overview of where we expect that detention site to be built. He assumes this will have a benefit for other businesses and residences in the neighborhood as well.

Director Braverman stated that the underground detention will be under the eastern parking lot near the rear area and the flood plain and storm water detention are actually not connected issues. They are two different issues.

Mayor Weiss stated that the flood plain issue has essentially been resolved. That area will eventually be removed from the flood plain.

Director Braverman explained that the flood plain is not related to the detention basin, but with the land and the contour of the land. Right now there is a little dip near Winslow Court and that piece has a few feet that is actually in the flood plain. That has been removed through surveying. Once the building is
built and that dip is filled in another action through FEMA will be taken again to permanently remove the entire site out of the flood plain. This is an ongoing issue with that site where the City has made application in 2005 to remove it from the flood plain. It was removed and then they did an update and put it back in. This has been an ongoing issue with FEMA and this site.

Mayor Weiss stated that this is an example of how the City and Confluent have worked cooperatively in conjunction with each other to resolve an otherwise issue that causes difficulty in the development and financing process. We have been pleased at how cooperative the relationship has been and we have been able to work through every issue that has come up.

Council member Mr. Roeder stated that he would like to highlight a comment that has already been made that bears repeating because it is important. In addition to the ongoing financial benefits from this development that were discussed in the prior agenda item, the City stands to gain approximately $1.3 million as part of this. That is significant especially in these uncertain times and the volatility that we might experience in coming years. Further as Council member Mr. Zimmerman pointed out, this provides a need not only in our community but in the larger area as well.

Council member Mrs. Moore stated that obviously the benefit of this development to the City economically and for all the people who would be able to use this as a possible resource for their aging friends and relatives the benefit is clear. She wanted to underline that every time we take a greenspace and develop it we create impervious surfaces. We take down trees that have roots that absorb storm water and the price we pay is that we have to create underground storm water detention systems to receive the rain water and run off that normally would have been seeping into the land through natural means. That is a tradeoff for development. In this case she believes there is a net gain not only because of the sum total that we will receive for the purchase of the land and building, but also because of the economic benefit and social benefit to our community.

It was moved by Mr. Malone, and seconded by Mr. Earl Williams, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-24 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried

Moved by Mr. Malone, and seconded by Mr. Earl Williams, that Ordinance No. 20-24 be enacted as read.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Ordinance Enacted
Ordinance No. 20-25, by Mrs. Moore, authorizing the vacation and accepting the dedication of right-of-way along a portion of Winslow Road adjacent to 16900 Van Aken Boulevard (Parcel Nos. 735-17-020 and 735-18-023) and adjacent to City-owned property on Winslow Court behind Shaker Towne Center (Parcel No. 735-17-018), and authorizing the transfer of a portion of said City-owned property on Winslow Court to Confluent Development LLC without competitive bidding, and declaring an emergency.

Joyce Braverman, Director of Planning, stated that this item is to authorize the vacation and dedication of the right-of-way. This will vacate a portion of Winslow Road, dedicate a new piece of Winslow Road and transfer a portion of the City-owned property on Winslow Court behind Shaker Town Center to the Confluent development which is now part of permanent parcel no. 735-17-018.

Mayor Weiss stated that this is a good result from a traffic standpoint and Confluent will be bearing that expense. He appreciates Council's support on this very important project.

It was moved by Mrs. Moore, and seconded by Mr. Malone, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-25 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call: 
Ayes:  
Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays:  None

Motion Carried

Moved by Mrs. Moore, and seconded by Mr. Malone, that Ordinance No. 20-25 be enacted as read.

Roll Call: 
Ayes:  
Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams
Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams
Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays:  None

Ordinance Enacted

Ordinance No. 20-26, by Mrs. Moore, authorizing the execution of Then and Now Certificates by the Director of Finance and the payment of amounts due for various purchase orders, and declaring an emergency.

Finance Director John Potts stated that there are two items requiring a Then and Now Certificate. Going forward he will be including the reasoning on the exhibit for Council on how these come to light. This
item is requested as an emergency and with a suspension of the rules for the transactions listed in the exhibit and that the payments be approved.

Council member Mrs. Moore congratulated the Finance Department on the recent Government Finance Officers Association award of achievement in excellence for financial reporting for the Comprehensive Annual Financial Report for the fiscal year ending December 13, 2018. This is the 13th straight year the City has earned the certificate of achievement.

It was moved by Mrs. Moore, and seconded by Mr. Earl Williams, that the rule requiring ordinances to be read on three different days be suspended and Ordinance No. 20-26 be placed upon its final enactment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Motion Carried

Moved by Mrs. Moore, and seconded by Mr. Earl Williams, that Ordinance No. 20-26 be enacted as read.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Roeder, Ms. Anne Williams Ms. Carmella Williams, Mr. Earl Williams Mr. Zimmerman, Mr. Malone, Mrs. Moore

Nays: None

Ordinance Enacted

*   *   *   *

Motion for Liquor Permit

TIRL LLC.
DBA Cilantro Taqueria
20090 Van Aken Blvd.

William M. Ondrey Gruber, Law Director, stated that this is a new liquor permit for Cilantro Taqueria which replaced Qdoba restaurant at Shaker Plaza. Police, Fire, Building and Housing Inspection, Planning and Economic Development had no objections to the new permit being issued for this address.

Council member Ms. Anne Williams stated that this is a wonderful addition to our community. She thinks their food is marvelous.

No objections were voiced by Council.

*   *   *   *   *
The Mayor asked the Clerk of Council to read into the record public comments received on other items.

Ms. Chaikin stated that no comments were received on other items by email or phone.

*   *   *   *

Mayor Weiss stated that this is obviously an incredibly challenging time. We as a City and this country as a nation, and indeed the world literally are fighting our way through this pandemic of the COVID-19. He recorded a message to employees over the weekend that was sent to employees today and he thought he would mention it because it is applicable not only to our employees but equally applicable to residents and generally to Council. He videoed it from home in keeping with the stay at home order in his front yard where he put up a flag. For those of you who are not aware the Governor requested that we put up flags to show strength and support for our communities and our nation so he hopes they will join him if they can. He wanted to also tell the residents and Council how much he appreciates the incredible efforts and coming together of this community. We should not be surprised in the sense that we do this when we face adversity, but this is something unlike we have ever seen before that has challenged and disrupted our lives both personally as well as at work. Whether you are helping or care for an aging or sick family member or you are trying to keep your kids on track with their school work at home, we all recognize and appreciate the incredible difficulty so many of us are going through. From the work standpoint our hearts go out to those that have either had reduced income or lost work as a result of this incredibly challenging situation. He did not want to miss the opportunity to remind the general public as well as Council on how important it is for us to get through this difficult time depends on how strictly we comply with the stay at home order. Hopefully, people are staying at home as much as possible with perhaps some outdoor exercise and walking. If you do need to leave, maintaining social distancing protocols are vitally important. He has doubled the 6 feet general wisdom to being more than 10 feet away from others. In doing so we will protect the safety of our first responders as well as reduce the burden on an increasingly overwhelmed healthcare system. He would be remiss if he did not comment about incredible efforts that our community has come together to do whether volunteering, replacing elastic on N95 masks, to calls being made to our seniors to ensure they are not left alone physically or emotionally. The work our residents have done is truly remarkable. He can’t stop without commenting on our staff, particularly our first responders: Police, Fire and Public Works employees who are truly on the front line, but this goes for all of our employees. People are making incredible sacrifices and working some very long hours, working from home, managing families and family situations while doing an incredible job, and Council has provided the support. It is amazing how we have come together during this challenging time where we each have our own stresses and strains and challenges that we are addressing at home and yet at the same time we are moving forward as a City, state and nation. We will come out the other end of this. We are in this with you and together. He hopes everyone will be healthy and well and thanks them for their service to their community, state and country. He thanked Council for making the first teleconference go smoothly and appreciates all of their guidance and support.

There being no further business before Council, the Mayor adjourned the meeting at 9:09 p.m.

_________________________________________.
DAVID E. WEISS, Mayor

_________________________________________.
JERI E. CHAIKIN, Clerk of Council