Members Present: Hans Walter, Chair
James Neville, Vice Chair
Sandra Madison, Member

Others Present: Daniel Feinstein, Senior Planner
Kelly Beck, Planning Specialist

The meeting was called to order by Senior Planner Dan Feinstein at 8:02 a.m.

*    *    *    *    *

Approval of minutes from the April 6, 2020 meeting.

Approved.

*    *    *    *    *

#20417 - 3441 Tuttle Road - Public Art.

Mr. Feinstein explained this review is for the location and installation method of public art and that the owner of the property will choose the art later.

Jason Russell, RMS Corporations, said this is a partnership with the City of Shaker Heights. The plans for the district always included as much art as possible. This wall needs attention. They propose six panels with art that can be changed easily, potentially on a yearly basis, but possibly every other year. The plan is to be able see the art when in your vehicle in the parking garage on the first floor and from the walkway level.

Mr. Neville said the panel size is reasonable. The application says 8 by 10 foot panels. He asked if that is correct.

Mr. Russell said they originally looked at 8 by 8 panels, but prefer a rectangular look.

Mr. Walter asked how the frames attach to the wall.

Mr. Russell said the frames are drilled into the cinder block. The vinyl art is then stretched over the frame.
Mr. Walter said he likes the idea but is concerned about illumination. There appear to be four general illumination lights. He would like to make sure there is enough light to see the art at night.

Mr. Russell said they would assess this after the art is installed. If there is not enough light they plan lighting off the deck of the garage. He noted there had been over 150 submissions received for this art installation.

Approved.

*    *    *    *    *

#20418 - 3449 Tuttle Road - Patio Railing—Craft Collective.

Mr. Feinstein explained the location of the railing sections. This is due to state liquor regulations requiring Craft Collective to enclose their leased portion of the patio in order to have outdoor consumption. They propose a series of planters.

Mr. Russell said it was helpful to do the temporary fence to see how the public engaged the patio as a whole. They are now asking for a visual barrier and added greenspace. They will use wood elements like inside the Market Hall and outside the building on the Shinola element. This is needed for the Outdoor Refreshment Area in order to allow glass containers on this patio. Craft Collective also has longer hours than the ORA.

Mr. Neville said the 5 foot planter panels are a nice proportion and spacing. He would like to see even spaces throughout, meaning another planter on the north side.

Approved with the following conditions: 1) One additional planter on the north side to provide uniform spacing between planters; and 2) stain used to keep natural wood look.

Revised plans to be submitted for administrative review.

*    *    *    *    *

#20415 - 22532 Rye Road - Window/Door Alterations.

Mark Oliver, Gunton Corporation, representing Patrick and Kori Sovacool, homeowners.

Approved before the meeting with conditions during COVID 19 as authorized by the Board at their March 16, 2020 meeting.

Revised quote to be submitted for administrative review showing new double casement window.

*    *    *    *    *

#20416 - 19200 South Park Boulevard - Resubmission: Addition.

Mr. Feinstein explained the Board has reviewed this item several times. This submission includes
revised window detailing.

Joseph Park, JP Compass, said on the east elevation the double door has been changed to a window for symmetry. This door has been moved to the south elevation, facing the rear yard. The larger changes are that they have converted some doors to windows on the rear elevation. They have added a bay window which was a big window and with the arched brick. That design seemed too much. This bay relates more to the hip roof and Clarence Mack architecture.

Mr. Walter asked if the roof on the bay is a standing seam material.

Mr. Park confirmed it was copper. This change also brings a painted wood detail to this area.

Mr. Neville said the changes are good. They retain the specialness of the arch detailing.

Mr. Walter noted the design has improved with each review.

Approved.

*    *    *    *    *

#20420 - 21950 East Byron Road - Porch Alteration. Door Alteration. Window Alteration.

John Payne, TPA Builders, representing Char Glatley, homeowner.

Approved before the meeting with conditions during COVID 19 as authorized by the Board at their March 16, 2020 meeting.

Revised plans detailing scope of work will be submitted for administrative review.

*    *    *    *    *

#20423 - 3335 Ardmore Road - Window/Door Alterations.

George Clemens and Andrew Reynolds, Clemens Pantuso Architecture, representing Mary Bertsch, homeowner.

Approved before the meeting during COVID 19 as authorized by the Board at their March 16, 2020 meeting.

*    *    *    *    *

#20424 - 3593 Ludgate Road - New House.

Mr. Feinstein said this developer has constructed a house three doors down at 3609 Ludgate, which is almost complete. The proposal is the same design. After a discussion with staff about the Single Family Design Guidelines repeating architecture, the applicant is considering a color change or move to another lot either at 3651 or 3565 Ludgate, farther away from the house currently under construction. He noted the policy statement regarding materials for this neighborhood has been met
and is included in this packet.

John Traina, B.R. Knez Construction, confirmed this is the same house, with a different color scheme. They are also fine with moving the proposed house down the street. They have other designs, but they are not yet designed to Shaker Heights standards.

Mr. Neville said he would prefer to have the house on an alternative lot. The street has different homes. He would not like two homes of the same design in this proximity to each other.

Ms. Madison said she agrees that the proposed house should be moved further away from the one still under construction.

There was a discussion regarding the window choice and details for each.

Mr. Traina said the house under construction is sided in “Storm” color siding. The new proposal is “Harbor Blue”.

Mr. Walter said the house under construction has concerning details around the rear door. The door is not trimmed like the windows, with the sight line much narrower than the other trim. The windows on the side and rear elevations are not shown with the same trim as the front windows.

Mr. Traina said they could specify 3.5 inch trim around the rear door to match the window trim in the house. They will use the Jeldwen windows with the same trim as on the house under construction and will revise the plans to match on all elevations.

Approved with the following conditions: 1) 3.5 inch window trim throughout the house; 2) matching 3.5 inch trim around the rear door; 3) choose a different lot further down the street for this house design at either 3561 or 3565 Ludgate Road.

Revised plans are to be submitted for administrative review.

*    *    *    *    *

**20412 - 2552 Warwick Road - Resubmission: New House.**

John Williams, architect, explained a 3D sketch and color elevations are now provided with the plans. The detail of the garage roof railing is also part of the plan set. He provided a photo of the sample materials.

Mr. Neville asked about the railing height.

Mr. Williams confirmed there is a parapet on the garage, then the railing. He confirmed it is code-compliant.

There was discussion regarding specifics of detail and design.

Mr. Walter said the shaded and color renderings help describe the house design and are much appreciated.
Ms. Madison the first floor entry is more successful moved back from the front elevation instead of out in front as is the current design.

Mr. Williams said he would review with the client to determine if that movement is possible.

Approved.

If the front entry design changes, revised plans will be reviewed by the Board.

*    *    *    *

#20410 - 2544 Cheshire Road - Resubmission: Rear Addition.

Mr. Feinstein noted this request was reviewed at the last meeting and that the Board asked for a design professional to prepare plans.

Diane Bija, New Creation Builders, said she provided additional photos and confirmed the foundation is dark grey paint to match the house.

Mr. Neville said he would like to confirm the new siding is continuous to the existing house. The corner board should be removed and the new siding toothed-in.

Ms. Bija confirmed they would remove the corner boards and tooth-in the new wood siding for a continuous look.

Ms. Madison asked if there is an opportunity for windows on the side elevation.

Ms. Bija said this is a powder room and the only window is on the rear wall.

Approved with the following conditions: 1) the brick foundation will be painted to match the existing house foundation, which is painted dark grey brick; and 2) new siding toothed in and existing corner boards removed.

*    *    *    *


Mr. Feinstein explained this house is being renovated. Those renovations include a new garage, rear porch renovation, and window alterations.

Mike Khmelnitsky, Homes on Demand, said they propose to enclose both stories of the rear porch. They will have rectangular windows and salvaged garage siding to use to tooth-in the areas on the first and second stories of the porch as well as the window that will be completely removed. The new entrance in to the house and porch at the rear will have a brick and sandstone step unit.

Mr. Walter asked the function of the second floor. What is the detail of the blacked-out window?
Mr. Khmelnitsky said they are creating a second floor master suite. The porch becomes the closet. They propose to paint drywall and then insulate behind the window.

Mr. Walter said he is concerned about moisture in the space between the drywall and window.

Mr. Khmelnitsky said the window is not locked from the inside. Any maintenance can be done via a ladder from the outside of the house.

Mr. Feinstein noted the Board normally asks for a black panel material to reduce fading and/or flaking.

Mr. Neville said the use of a black laminate panel holds up well on a ¾ inch plywood surface.

Mr. Khmelnitsky said the new two car garage would be in the same location. The roof material will match the house roof. They are planning to replace the house roof as well.

There was discussion regarding the garage siding color. The Board agreed they would like to see a sample of siding colors against the existing house siding to determine what is most appropriate.

Approved house alterations with the condition that the blacked-out window is filled with black laminate material for longevity instead of painted material.

Approved garage with the following conditions: 1) rubbed concrete foundation finish; 2) confirmation of siding color via photo against house siding; 3) roof shingle color to match staff approved new house roof color; and 4) security light over the garage door, not the carriage light.

Siding color to be submitted via email as a photo. Revised plans will be submitted for administrative review with notes pertaining to conditions 1, 3, and 4 above.

*    *    *    *

#20425 - 16500 Van Aken Boulevard - Entry Alterations.

Mr. Feinstein explained there are extensive interior renovations planned for the main Library.

Ben Crabtree, Bialosky Cleveland, explained they would be dealing with a part of a 1992 renovation to the entryway. They will not be altering the original building. They propose to improve accessibility and approachability. The existing ramp is tucked behind a planter and the switchbacks have a cavernous feeling. The new ramp is pulled forward for a better entry. They will remove the brick pilasters on either side of the entry and set a new cast stone signage area. The patio is modified for free-standing benches and planters.

Mr. Neville likes the revision to the ramp, as it is cavernous now, as well as the new path. His concern is accessing this ramp once you have exited the building. The steps are very close.

Mr. Crabtree said they have considered using the railings as a barrier by extending them at the top step to curve toward one another. This also leaves room for the benches.
Mr. Neville said the existing stone lintel fans out at the ends. Removal of this lintel will require patching. He likes the brick soldier course detail on the new plans, but could that detail be pushed out into the coursing beyond the door jamb? Then the collar joint is in line with the brick jamb below. This would be an extension of approximately 8 inches to each side.

Approved with the following conditions: 1) submit a detail drawing of how the corner extension of the new ramp and railing meet the building; 2) widening the panel and surrounding brick soldier course detail above the entry doors by about 8 inches to each side; 3) add existing entry brick base detail to the plans; and 4) strongly suggest additional railings be added to each side of the existing stair rail to improve ADA access and safety.

Revised drawings to be submitted for Board review.

*    *    *    *    *

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 10:15 a.m. The next meeting will be May 4, 2020.

Hans Walter, Chair
Architectural Board of Review

James Neville, Vice Chair
Architectural Board of Review