The meeting was called to order by Chair Sean Malone at 7:32 A.M.

* * *

**APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 17, 2019 MEETING MINUTES**

Chair Malone stated that approval of the minutes of the June 17, 2019 meeting are being held until the August meeting.

* * *

**AUTHORIZING AN AMENDMENT TO THE CONTRACT WITH SHARK&MINNOW TO DEVELOP NEW STRATEGIC PHOTO AND VIDEO ASSETS FOR USE IN A CAMPAIGN TO ATTRACT AND RETAIN RESIDENTS IN THE AMOUNT OF $39,567 MAKING TOTAL AMOUNT $204,567.**

Julie Voyzey, Director of Communications and Marketing stated this is requesting an authorizing an amendment to the personal services contract with shark&minnow in the amount of $39,567 making the total contract amount $204,567 to be used to develop new strategic photo and video assets for use in the campaign to attract and retain residents in the coming years. The funds are coming from the Communications and Marketing budgets for 2019 and 2020.
The proposed amendment to the Attract and Retain contract provides for production of a documentary style brand video that will be both intimate and cinematic. It will contain an overview of the community and will highlight the impact of the people and the place, demonstrating the factors that motivate moving to and remaining in Shaker – which are at the heart of the Attract and Retain Campaign.

The video will run between three and five minutes in length, allowing it to be both comprehensive and adhering to digital video best practices. In addition, creation of the video addresses the department’s restructuring, in which it has reoriented away from staff-conducted city tours, requests for which have dropped significantly over the years. In addition, the video shoots will be treated as asset collection sessions, capturing photographs during these sessions which will benefit both shakeronline.com and the campaign landing page, Shaker365.com and will replenish and update the photo archives. The agency will also film and format short clips from the interviews (vignettes), b-roll (supplemental footage), and behind-the-scenes video for use in social media contexts (i.e., stories).

The Communications and Marketing committee reviewed this proposal on June 20, 2019 and voted unanimously in favor of recommending the amendment to the contract. Committee members were enthusiastic about the Shaker365 campaign and agreed that creating a brand video and incorporating additional shorter vignettes will enhance the reach and impact of the “Attract and Retain” campaign.

Council member Williams stated the videos produced by shark&minnow are extremely impressive and capture exactly what Shaker has to offer, putting it into a storybook format.

Citizen member Kolb questioned if the videos incorporate information about both the schools and libraries in the same way that Shaker Life Magazine does.

Director Voyzey stated that it will and include all the reasons why people choose to live and stay in Shaker.

Citizen member Moore stated that when something new comes out, it is greeted with enthusiasm. Since one of the goals is to attract would the City be receiving any feedback from the real estate agents.

Director Voyzey stated that one of the members on the committee is a real estate agent and was very enthusiastic about the video. The real estate agent suggested the video be moved to a part of the website that is strictly used for attracting new residents since it provides information about the City.

In response to Citizen member Moore regarding feedback beyond the committee, Director Voyzey stated that the City does have an ongoing relationship with the realtors and school and would ask for their feedback during a meeting.

Citizen member Lalley asked if there was a percentage breakdown of advertising between social media and print and are the dollars aligned with that split.

Director Voyzey stated that the City does rely on the marketing firm and their understanding of the different audiences and the City’s allocation is based on that audience. The ads in the Shaker Life magazine are house ads with a zero cost to the City and the distribution of the magazine is to all residents and hopefully 100% are reached.
Citizen member Lalley asked if the City believed that Shaker had enough readers to continue to justify the magazine and that she was only comparing print versus electronics.

In response to Chair Malone regarding the City overseeing the video production with shark&minnow, Director Voyzey stated the City meets with shark&minnow to discuss the topics and events that the City wants to capture and how they are to be captured. They discuss if a person should be a focus of the video, with the final always being the reflection of the entire community. Everything that is produced is reviewed and approved by the City.

The Finance and Administration Committee recommended authorizing an amendment to the contract with shark&minnow to develop new strategic photo and video assets for use in a campaign to attract and retain residents in the amount of $39,567 making total amount $204,567.

*   *   *   *

AUTHORIZING A THREE-YEAR CONTRACT WITH RORY O'CONNOR IN THE AMOUNT OF $60,000 PER YEAR FOR OPERATING AND EDITORIAL CONSULTING SERVICES FOR SHAKER LIFE MAGAZINE FOR THE PERIOD OF JANUARY 1, 2020 THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2022.

Director Voyzey stated that this item is a recommendation to enter into a three-year personal service contract with Rory O'Connor in the amount of $60,000 per year for Operating and Editorial Consulting Services for *Shaker Life* magazine for the period beginning January 1, 2020 through December 31, 2022.

Shaker Life has been a publication of the City of Shaker Heights for 35 years and is mailed to all homes, free of charge, on a quarterly basis. The results of the Triad Survey is used as a guide with editorial content being developed to remind current residents why they chose to live in Shaker and what they love about the City. The magazine serves as a way to deepen their connection to the City and encourage their continued commitment and investment in their homes.

The Communications & Marketing Department staff act as publisher and writers for the magazine. In addition we contract with a team of consultants for varies positions including Editor, Design and Advertising team, freelance writers, photographers and proofreader, and a printer. Shaker resident Rory O'Connor is the current editor of *Shaker Life* with the contract expiring December 31, 2019.

Request for Qualifications for the position was distributed on May 6 and was posted on the City’s website and promoted on social media channels. It was also emailed directly to individuals who have worked with the magazine, have editorial experience, and/or who may know people with the skill set to be a successful editor. Two submissions were received.

After careful review within the department, we are confident that Rory O'Connor is the best-qualified person for the position. He is an award-winning writer with 35 years of experience in newspaper and magazine journalism, public relations and marketing and has served as editor of *Shaker Life* since 2005. For 20 years, until 2009, he was principal in Whelan Communications, a public relations and publications consulting firm. Prior to that, he gained experience as a writer for a variety of magazines in Florida and Cleveland, eventually becoming Managing Editor of *Cleveland Magazine*. 
Over the years, Mr. O’Connor has proven to be a valuable partner in advancing the attract and retain goals of this department by proposing features that reflect the City’s priorities and the Triad Survey results about why residents live in and love Shaker. He understands the power of using the magazine as a vehicle to retain residents, and more recently how to carefully create editorial content to appeal to prospective residents, as well.

Under his direction, the magazine now includes a Great Shaker Homes series which has been instrumental in shining a spotlight on the City’s incredible housing stock while leveraging housing contractor advertising. He also created the Work-Live feature to support the goals of the Economic Development Department, and recently launched a series called Brilliant Careers to highlight residents who have had unusual career paths and achieved acclaim in their profession. The most recent of these focused on architect Bob Madison, a feature written by Mr. O’Connor, which is the centerpiece of a submission of *Shaker Life* for a national award.

In addition, during his tenure as editor, Mr. O’Connor recommended and facilitated the contracting of a professional ad manager, which has been transformative in terms of steadily increasing ad sales and reducing public subsidy. In 2018, the total expenses for four issues were $204,335 and revenues were $201,163. The taxpayer subsidy for four issues was only $3,172. We are on pace for a similar subsidy for 2019.

Under the leadership of Rory O’Connor, who coordinates the magazine team, the production of *Shaker Life* works like a well-oiled machine. His extensive magazine experience, ability to manage the team, deep knowledge about Shaker Heights, and his complete understanding of the goals of *Shaker Life* make him ideally suited for the position. Longevity and consistency in the editor position are crucial to maintaining a smooth running magazine operation in a busy City department. For these reasons, the Operating and Editorial Consulting Services contract works best as a three-year term.

The Communications and Marketing Committee reviewed this proposal on June 20, 2019 and voted unanimously in favor of recommending the contract with Mr. O’Connor.

Citizen member Lalley stated that each time she received the magazine, she wondered just how many residents actually read the magazine and believed the City was wasting money printing it.

Chair Malone stated the cost to produce the magazine was $204,000 and the revenues were $201,000 which includes everything except the Communication and Marketing staff time.

Citizen member Cicarella stated that before this item was presented he was under the belief and sure that residents also believe that this magazine is costing the City a lot of money to produce, only to discover it is not. He suggested that residents need to know that the advertising is actually taking care of the magazine cost.

Mayor Weiss stated that there is a surprising number of residents that still depend on print.

Director Voyzey stated that the magazine is also in an electronic format for those that prefer that format.
The Finance and Administration Committee recommended authorizing a three-year contract with Rory O’Connor in the amount of $60,000 per year for Operating and Editorial Consulting Services for Shaker Life magazine for the period of January 1, 2020 through December 31, 2022.

* * * * *

AUTHORIZING THE CITY TO ENTER INTO AN LPA AGREEMENT WITH OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION (ODOT) FOR THE WARRENSVILLE CENTER ROAD RESURFACING PROJECT.

Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works, stated that the City has received the Northeast Ohio Arcawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA) funding through their Provisional Transportation Asset Management Program established in 2014, for the federal Local Public Agency Project (LPA), resurfacing of Warrensville Center Road from Fairmount Blvd. to Farnsleigh Road. This project was originally programmed by NOACA for 2016; however due to all of the road reconfiguration and the new Van Aken Development, the City requested that it be postponed until 2020. The project involves resurfacing of approximately 1.36 miles of Warrensville Center Road. The work will include a minimum of three (3) inches of asphalt pavement removal and resurfacing, partial and full depth base pavement and joint repairs, the construction of ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act) compliant curb ramps and minor curb replacements. The project will also include pavement markings and associated adjustments to grade of castings. The City of Shaker Heights will administer this project which includes design, construction, inspection and management.

The LPA program is a partnership between Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), ODOT and local public agencies to develop, plan and construct projects with Federal, State and local funds. As part of the LPA process, ODOT is requesting to enter into an agreement with the City.

The estimated project cost is $2,625,115. This cost includes construction and construction administration / inspection; design fees are not included in the aforementioned project cost. The design fee is anticipated to be $120,000 based on similar projects. Per NOACA funding, ODOT’s cap is $1,648,000. The City of Shaker Heights is obligated to provide $977,115 for our share.

The City’s contribution is to be included in the 2020 Capital for Street Resurfacing. In the recent past Council has allocated $2 million dollars for street resurfacing, if that is the same for 2020 then we could resurface Warrensville Center Road and approximately eight other streets. If less than $2 million is available then Warrensville Center Road will be our street resurfacing program for 2020.

ODOT has provided the necessary documents to execute the agreement. A request is that Council approve the necessary legislation so the City can enter into an LPA Agreement with ODOT for the Warrensville Center Road Resurfacing project.

In response to Chair Malone regarding the renovation of the bridge over the RTA tracks, Director Speese stated that project belonged to Cuyahoga County and would be done after the completion of this project.

In response to Council member Williams regarding the gas tax and possible funding, Director Speese stated that the gas tax is state funds and would have no impact on this project being federal funds.
The Finance and Administration Committee recommended authorizing the City to enter into an LPA Agreement with Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) for the Warrensville Center Road Resurfacing Project.

* * * * *

AUTHORIZING THE CITY'S APPLICATION FOR AND ACCEPTANCE OF A $50,000 GRANT FROM THE CUYAHOGA COUNTY HEALTHY URBAN TREE CANOPY GRANT PROGRAM (COUNTY HUTC) FOR THE PRUNING OF LARGE OAK TREES ON LARCHMERE BOULEVARD, COURTLAND BOULEVARD AND BRIGHTON ROAD.

Director Speese stated that Cuyahoga County has created a new grant program to help enhance the tree canopy throughout all the suburbs within the borders of Cuyahoga County. The goal of this grant is to protect the existing tree canopy, expand the tree canopy in vulnerable areas and establish new tree canopies.

This is a competitive grant which has been established to complement the efforts of the Cuyahoga County Department of Sustainability and the strategies published in the Cuyahoga County Climate Change Action Plan. This program plans on awarding five million dollars over the next five years. The Grant Workshop was held this week and the applications are due on Monday, July 29th and the awarded grant projects will be announced on August 23, 2019.

The anticipated award amount will be in the $25,000 - $50,000 range per year and municipalities can submit a request each year or for individual projects. The awarded municipality will need to contribute 5% matching funds toward their project. We would like to apply for the entire $50,000 with the City providing $5,000 from the Tree Assessment budget. We would use the grant funds to hire a company to prune the very large oak trees that line Larchmere Blvd., Courtland Blvd. and Brighton Road. Due to their size and the need to remove all of the large dead limbs and not having the equipment and manpower to do so, in-house an outside contractor is required to perform this work. Our current budget does not have the funds to perform this work.

In response to Council member Williams regarding subsiding this program yearly, Director Speese stated that the City would apply for the grant yearly.

The Finance and Administration Committee recommended authorizing the City’s application for and acceptance of $50,000 grant from the Cuyahoga County Healthy Urban Tree Canopy Grant Program (County HUTC) for the pruning of large oak trees on Larchmere Boulevard, Courtland Boulevard and Brighton Road.

* * * * *

AUTHORIZING A REQUEST FOR ACCEPTANCE AND APPROPRIATION OF CAROL PETERSEN GRANT FUNDS IN THE AMOUNT OF $75,000 FOR A HOUSING MAINTENANCE PROGRAM.

Colin Compton, Neighborhood and Housing Specialist, stated this item is a request to accept and appropriate $75,000 in grant funds from the 2019 Carol M. Peterson Housing Fund of the Federal
Home Loan Bank of Cincinnati. The City received approval in June to fund 10 households with up to $7,500 each in accessibility upgrades and emergency repair work.

The purpose of this grant program is to provide low-to-moderate income, disabled and/or elderly (age 60+) homeowners in Ohio, Kentucky and Tennessee the opportunity to live safely in their current home. Properties must be owner-occupied, single-family homes to be eligible for grant funds. Eligible accessibility improvements can include installing grab bars and handrails, widening doors, altering cabinets, replacing fixtures, replacing flooring and more. Eligible emergency repairs can include roof repair or replacement, electrical and plumbing system repairs, heating/air system repairs, structural repairs to floors or walls, code violations, and more.

Approximately $2M was available for the 2019 program and all funds were allocated within hours of the application opening.

This is now the fifth year that the City has been approved for funding from this program. Through 2018, a total of twenty-nine projects have been completed representing approximately $202,710 in residential repair and improvement work at no direct cost to the City.

This year, the Economic Development Department received approval for 10 new projects. Three projects are in Moreland, two are in Lomond, three are in Mercer, and two are in Onaway. This year’s projects include correction of exterior violations, interior safety upgrades, roofing, masonry, and accessibility improvements.

No matching funds are required from the City or from the homeowners. The funder requires the City to pay for the improvements and be reimbursed once work is complete. To date, all completed projects have been successful in receiving a full reimbursement from the funder.

The Neighborhood Revitalization and Development Committee reviewed this request at their meeting on July 10 and recommended approval of the request to accept and appropriate funds. Discussion at that meeting centered on how the application and reimbursement processes function for this grant. Staff explained the process for the City to apply for the grant and that the reimbursements for each project occur when documentation is sent to the funder showing that the work is complete, inspected, approved, and paid for by the City.

In response to Chair Malone regarding selection of the 10 homes, Mr. Compton stated that each year this program is marketing through a number of different ways and once contacted by a resident, during the conversation it will be determined if the home fits the program they will be added to a list to potentially apply.

Council member Williams stated ESOP is a group that advocates for seniors that are in need of assistance in paying taxes and home repairs and will direct them to this program.

In response to Citizen member Kolb regarding need versus selection, Mr. Compton stated that the lender eliminates two-family homes upfront and that others are reviewed to make sure they fit the criteria of the program and then selection is made on a first come first serve basis with the over ten be added to next year’s list.
The Finance and Administration Committee recommended authorizing a request for acceptance and appropriation of Carol Petersen Grant Funds in the amount of $75,000 for a Housing Maintenance Program.

* * * *

AUTHORIZING AN APPROPRIATION IN THE AMOUNT OF $20,000 TO BE USED FOR NATIONAL FIRE PROTECTION ASSOCIATION TO PROVIDE REGIONAL HOT WORKS TRAINING FOR THE FIRE DEPARTMENT.

Patrick Sweeney, Chief of Fire, stated that on July 10, 2018 a fire at Fernway Elementary School was caused by contractors using torches to apply new roof to the building. After the fire, the City began to review any and all options to minimize reoccurrence of a fire of this type. After a thorough review of all options, local regulations were enacted which strengthened the Hot Works Permitting Process along with requiring safety training for contractors prior to the issuance of a permit to conduct hot works in occupancies in Shaker Heights.

The City successfully prosecuted the roofing company for causing the fire. The company is required to provide hot work safety training to their entire staff along with $35,000 in fines. The fines imposed will be used to recover personnel cost to the Fire Department along with providing training to all members of the Fire Department and Shaker School Facility Maintenance Staff. Additionally this training will be provided to all of the Fire Safety Inspectors throughout the Northeast Ohio Fire Prevention Association.

In an effort to expedite the department and regional training, the Fire Department is requesting an appropriation of $20,000 from the General Fund. This item was presented to the Safety and Public Works Committee on July 12, 2019.

In response to Council member Williams regarding the possibility of institutionalizing this training, Chief Sweeney stated that is excellent idea and he has no answer. Shaker Fire Department is the first to enact legislation like this requiring contractors to go through this type of training. The State Fire Marshall's Office is aware of this and other cities throughout the country have been contacted and request for both legislation and training have been requested.

Citizen member Cicarella suggested that Chief Sweeney consider including the libraries in this program.

In response to Citizen member Lalley regarding contractors being trained, Chief Sweeney stated that all contractors are required to take this training, not just municipality contractors.

Citizen member Lalley stated concern that required training may impact residents getting qualified contractors to work in Shaker if Shaker is the only City requiring this training presently.

Chief Sweeney stated that an online certification training program has been developed that allows contractors to receive the certification in a little over an hour at home.

Citizen member Cicarella asked if the Chief believed this certification training could possibly lower cost to the companies with their liability insurance.
Chief Sweeney stated in conversations with insurance companies, the payout cost to the insurance companies are huge due to the untrained personnel of companies they insure. Certifications could have positive effects on their premiums.

Citizen member Lalley stated that this program needs to be required statewide.

Citizen member Kolb stated that daily there is a roofing contractor working in Shaker and this could have the possibility of no contractor wanting to work here.

The Finance and Administration Committee recommended authorizing an appropriation in the amount of $20,000 to be used for National Fire Protection Association to provide regional hot works training for the Fire Department.

* * *

**ACCEPTING A PROPOSAL AND AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH EUTHENICS INC. IN THE AMOUNT OF $64,130 FOR DESIGN/ENGINEERING SERVICES.**

Joyce Braverman, Director of Planning, stated this item is requesting the acceptance of a proposal and authorizing a personal services contract for professional design/engineering services with Euthenics, Inc. in the total not to exceed amount of $64,130 for the Shaker Boulevard/Warrensville Center Road Intersection Improvement Project.

In 2018 the City completed a traffic study with HNTB Corporation. The project received NOACA Transportation for Livable Communities (TLCI) funding and therefore must meet ODOT LPA requirements. This project will make infrastructure changes to improve operations for motorist, pedestrians and cyclist.

A Request for Proposals (RFP) was posted on the city website on Monday, June 10, 2019. Only one proposal was received on July 1, 2019, from Euthenics, Inc. Euthenics, Inc. provided a proposal that met the RFP requirements and demonstrated the qualifications needed for the project. Although they were the only respondents, they are qualified due to extensive experience with similar intersection improvement projects. They also have experience working with ODOT, utility companies, and are working in this area as part of the Warrensville Center Road Bridges over the GCRTA project.

The Safety and Public Works Committee reviewed and approved this item at their meeting on July 12, 2019.

In response to Chair Malone regarding timeframe, Director Braverman stated the design will be in 2019 and constructed is 2020.

Citizen member Cicarella stated that he is a biker and this plan is not user friendly to bikers.

Director Braverman stated that this is not the final plan and only a design and that a bike path is in the plans.

Jeri Chaikin, Chief Administrative Officer, stated that two public meetings are scheduled.
The Finance and Administration Committee recommended accepting a proposal and authorizing a contract with Euthenics Inc. in the amount of $64,130 for Design/Engineering Services.

* * * *

**AUTHORIZING A PURCHASE, DEVELOPMENT AND USE AGREEMENT WITH CONFLUENT DEVELOPMENT LLC IN ORDER TO CONSTRUCT AN 80 UNIT ASSISTED LIVING AND MEMORY CARE FACILITY ON THE CURRENT VACANT THREE ACRE PARCEL FORMERLY KNOWN AS AVALON STATION 2.**

Director Braverman stated that this is a recommendation to authorize the City administration to enter into a Purchase, Development and Use Agreement with Confluent Development LLC in order to construct an 80 unit Assisted Living and Memory Care facility on the current vacant three acre formerly known as Avalon Station 2. The property is within the Shaker Town Center Tax Increment Financing (TIF) district. Development of this parcel will contribute to TIF proceeds which will be used to pay off TIF bonds.

Confluent is a developer based in Denver that develops a wide range of projects from commercial to assisted living. They propose to purchase the three acre property from the City and develop an Assisted Living and Memory Care building. The project is proposed to be one building with not less than 80 units with at least 50% being assisted living units and the rest are memory care units.

The project will have no less than 80 units and preliminary plans show 98 units. The purchase price is $13,500 per unit and will total between $1M and $1.3M. The payroll is estimated at $1M and real estate taxes are estimated at $500,000. The share of taxes that may be paid into the TIF district is estimated at $350,000.

The Development Agreement was presented to the Neighborhood Revitalization and Development Committee on July 10, 2019 and a discussion was held.

Chair Malone asked about the only expenditures the City was responsible for presently are legal fees.

Director Braverman stated that was correct.

In response to Chair Malone regarding Confluent not meeting their deadlines, Director Braverman stated that there are outs built into the agreement.

In response to Citizen member Moore regarding the purchase of the property, Director Braverman stated that the purchase of the property occurs at the time of transfer meaning all the conditions of purchase have been met.

In response to Citizen member Lalley regarding Confluent being an operator of the facility, Director Braverman stated that Confluent is not an operator. Confluent has a partner named Harbor Chase that does the operations and references has been checked for both.

Citizen member Lalley stated that the concern should be that the City has enough built-in so that the worst case scenario is the City is not left with a shell for a building that no one wants to use. She
expressed concern that there is a lot of conditions with purchasing of the building and nothing in regards to the operations of the facility.

Director Braverman stated that the memo did not highlight the operations in the agreement and the City would prefer not to buy back after a building has been built on the site, so there are buy back clauses before the building.

Citizen member Moore stated that the operations piece should be part of the condition of closing to ensure the partnership is still in place.

Citizen member Lalley stated that the arrangement between the builder and operations is a very important part of the agreement.

Director Braverman stated this is not a final plan, only a concept plan and many changes will occur before a final agreement will be met.

Chair Malone stated the potential upside for this that we have money to pay off some of these TIF bonds that are still outstanding from last Shaker Town Center back in the 90s.

Citizen member Lalley stated that that is an inaccurate statement with what has been presented. The presentation shows only a building and shows no ability to pay the TIF without the operations piece in this legislation.

Mayor Weiss stated this is a significant investment and doesn’t believe this company is in the business only to build a building and will only make money if the building is in full operations. Many calls have been made checking the references of Confluent and all references have been positive.

Chair Malone suggested to Director Braverman to include in the memo to Council some of the projects that Confluent has worked on or completed.

The Finance and Administration Committee recommended authorizing a Purchase, Development and Use Agreement with Confluent Development LLC in order to construct an 80 unit Assisted Living and Memory Care facility on the current vacant three acre parcel formerly known as Avalon Station 2.

* * *

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:51 a.m. The next meeting will be August 19, 2019.

________________________________________
Frank J. Brichacek
Finance and Administration Committee