



**Architectural Board of Review Minutes
Tuesday, September 3, 2019
8 A.M.
City Council Chambers**

Members Present: Sandra Madison, Chair
Hans Walter, Vice Chair
James Neville, Member

Others Present: Daniel Feinstein, Senior Planner
Cameron Roberts, Planner

The meeting was called to order by Senior Planner, Dan Feinstein at 8:00 a.m.

* * * *

Approval of the August 19, 2019 Meeting Minutes

Approved.

* * * *

#20270 - 3333 Braemar Road – New Garage.

Mr. Stollfuss, homeowner, said the existing garage that is thought to be original to the property is sagging and showing signs of structural distress. He proposes demolishing the garage and building a new garage. The new garage will have an increased depth to accommodate modern sized vehicles.

The Board asked several questions about the proposed materials and colors. The roof will be an Ecostar artificial slate, colored Fairport Fern, to match the green hues of the original slate shingles on the garage. The siding will be yellow with white trim to match the original.

Mr. Neville advised the applicant to check with the Building Department to verify that the corner returns shown in the submitted plans meet code standards for structural integrity.

Approved.

A revised site plan must be submitted for administrative review.

* * * *

#20279 - 3270 Chadbourne Road – Second Story Addition.

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS

3400 Lee Road Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120 P 216.491.1400 F 216.491.1465 Ohio Relay Service 711
shakeronline.com www.shaker.life

Glen Beddies, homeowner, introduced the proposal.

The Board expressed that they will need to see how the siding material of the addition transitions with the existing brick and roof. The current plans would create an awkward look and they will need to know how the contractor plans to resolve that issue.

Mr. Beddies said that another addition was completed less than a year ago before he purchased the house. He said he might have information from that project available digitally.

Mr. Feinstein informed the applicant that the material for the proposed addition would need to match what was previously approved.

Tabled the review in order to address the material transition details from the siding to the existing brick and to the roof and provide information on materials and colors for the siding and roofing.

Revised plans must be submitted for Board review.

* * * *

#20280 - 19111 Shelburne Road - Pavilion.

Brian Shirk, Genesis Landscaping, explained that they are proposing to construct an outdoor pavilion that attaches to the house on the rear of the property. The project would include removal of two garage windows and construction of a false wall in front of the removed window space.

The Board reviewed the plans and expressed that they need to see detail on how the pavilion transitions and functions in relation to the roof and massing of the existing house. Notable concerns were drainage and the pitch of the pavilion roof in comparison to the house.

The Board suggested moving the pavilion off the house and into the rear yard to avoid these concerns.

Tabled to consider relocating the pavilion away from the house in the rear yard and the resulting redesigned structure.

* * * *

#20278 – 3445 Warrensville Center Road - Resubmission: Sign – Christ Episcopal Church.

Rhonda Haugabook presented two sign options: one with an address and one without. She explained that she verified that the original sign used to have the address hanging off the bottom before it rotted and fell off. She said the church prefers the option with the address.

The Board discussed the height of the sign in relation to the slope, as the exact height was not clear in the submitted drawings.

Mr. Feinstein said revised drawings would be needed to confirm the height of the sign from grade.

Approved with the address on the sign and with the condition that a drawing indicating the sign height is submitted.

Revised plans will be submitted for administrative review.

* * * *

#20281 – 19606 Scottsdale Boulevard - Garage.

Erik Swain, Frontgate Construction, said they are proposing to build a new garage. He said that he is proposing a front facing garage after confirming that the majority of surrounding garages are front facing. He said the garage siding will match the house dormer siding, the roof material will match the house, and the overhead door will be white and panelized. He also explained that the pitch of the garage was lowered from the original proposal to meet zoning requirements.

Approved a revised 14.5 foot tall garage design with pebble stone vinyl siding, matching roof shingles and white panelized doors.

* * * *

#20282 – 2762 Inverness Road – Seat Wall and Grille Enclosure.

Eduardo Flores, S & I Lawncare, explained the proposed project. He explained that the existing deck would be removed and replaced with a patio at grade. He said the patio stone will a lighter shade than the stone retaining walls.

The Board asked the applicant to provide photos of the proposed wall and floor stones against the house.

Mr. Flores returned later in the meeting to present the proposed stone material and photos of the house.

The Board found the proposed material to be appropriate.

Approved the Inverness Road side yard patio, seat walls and grille enclosure based on the material and color samples presented.

* * * *

#20283 – 3606 Lytle Road – New Single Family House.

James Haas, Westwork Architectural Studio, said they are proposing a new single-family house on Lytle Road. The previous home was recently lost due to a fire. He presented a list of proposed alternate materials for the new home compared to the materials of the original home.

Mr. Feinstein explained that a number of the proposed materials do not meet the Single Family Infill Design Guidelines adopted by both the Architectural Board of Review and City Planning Commission. He said the applicant will need to write a strong argument if they plan to propose

alternate materials.

The Board discussed the proposed materials and colors in detail, including the siding and window choices as well as potential alternate materials. The Board concluded that the alternate vinyl shake siding is not appropriate. The Board was in favor of only requiring simulated divided lite on the front façade. The side and rear façade windows can have grids between the glass. The Board suggested that the savings from the windows should help make funds available for the cedar shake siding. They concluded to uphold the siding design guideline requirements and that this house design is consistent with the neighborhood.

Mr. Feinstein informed the Board that the front bay will require a variance if it is to be at grade, rather than hanging. He said the existing foundation would also need a variance since it is slightly in front of the setback line.

The Board expressed that they prefer the design of the bay window element coming to grade.

Mr. Haas said they did provide door specifications because the homeowners are taking it upon themselves to find historic salvaged front and rear doors that complement the house design.

Mr. Feinstein said the doors could be staff approved if appropriate. He also encouraged the applicant to look into real cedar shake and cement board siding instead of vinyl siding in terms of cost differential.

Approved the new house with conditions: 1. Revise the roof form of the left side bump out element; 2. Use Beldon brick 'Belcrest 560' modular; 3. Simulated divided light windows only required on the front elevation with grids between the glass windows allowed on the other elevations; 4. Alternate material of vinyl shake siding is not approved; 5. 40 yr. warrantee or limited lifetime roof shingles required; 6. Brick and stone front and rear stoop and steps; 7. Staff review of wood doors selected by homeowner; 8. Board review of final color palate required before installation of exterior materials.

Revised plans will be submitted for administrative review.

* * * *

#20284 – 20142 Scottsdale Boulevard – Window to Door Alteration.

Ariel Levy, contractor, explained that the homeowners are proposing to convert a rear window to a door and construct new stairs that would connect to a patio. He said the stairs would have a wood frame surrounded by a composite material. He said the stairs come in two colors, dark grey or brown, and the homeowners prefer the dark grey color.

The Board expressed that they also prefer the dark grey color.

Approved with dark grey composite steps.

* * * *

#20285 – 22625 Westchester Road - Pergola.

Armin Kelly, homeowner, said he is proposing to construct a pergola in his rear yard. The pergola height will be in line with the beginning of the second story trim and will be colored white.

The Board found the proposal appropriate.

Approved.

* * * *

#20286 - 3146 Warrington Road – Window Alterations.

James Stumpf, contractor, presented a proposal to convert a sunroom to a bathroom, including window alterations.

Approved.

* * * *

#20263 – 2980 East Belvoir Oval – Resubmission: Rear Addition.

Samantha Ayottee, LDA Architecture, presented the resubmitted plans for a rear addition. She said that the Board’s comments from the August 5 meeting have been addressed.

The Board agreed that the revisions create a much better design.

Approved.

* * * *

#20253 – 20550 Byron Road – Resubmission: Front Entry Alteration

Michael Healy presented the revisions for a proposed front entry alteration. He said more detailed drawings were submitted to accurately reflect the existing details on the house.

The Board found the revised submission appropriate.

Approved the revised front entry design.

* * * *

19200 South Park Boulevard – Preliminary: Rear Additions.

George Clemens, architect, presented preliminary drawings for rear additions on this home. He explained that multiple additions are proposed. A right-wing will be added to the house and include both a connector to the original building footprint and a regulation-sized volleyball court. The other

side of the rear will be an addition for an indoor pool along with a second story addition.

Mr. Clemens presented two options for the right-wing addition that would complement the architectural style of the home. He mentioned that two existing chimneys would need to be removed in order to allow the second story addition.

The Board discussed the height of the windows on the proposed sport court addition. The addition is proposed at a lower elevation than the original house footprint, which causes the windows to be out of line with the rest of the building. The Board suggested moving the windows up higher to align with the existing windows.

Mr. Neville noted that he is not opposed to removal of the two chimneys, as the remaining third chimney would still look appropriate on the house by itself.

The Board expressed that they are open to the proposed project and asked the architect to continue onward for a more detailed review.

Discussion held.

* * * *

#20276 – 2976 Falmouth Road – Porch Conversion.

Ms. Tobin said they revised the plans per the Board’s last review. They extended the open portion over the deck.

The Board said the design is better and it just needs corner boards at all corners of the enclosed porch.

Approved with corner boards added to all corners.

Revised plans must be submitted for administrative review.

* * * *

Other Business

3306 Kenmore Road—Rear Bump Out.

Approved and suggested interior alterations to accommodate kitchen remodel. Plans need to be submitted for administrative review.

3656 Lytle Road—Windows.

Approved white windows with matching grids. Window specs and pictures need to be submitted for review.

22226 Parnell Road—Window Alteration.

Additional close up pictures of existing conditions are required for review.

22531 Rye Road—Fire Pit.

Approved with dark grey stone and cap.

* * * *

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:45 a.m. The next meeting will be September 16, 2019.



Sandra Madison, Chair
Architectural Board of Review



Hans Walter, Vice Chair
Architectural Board of Review